

## BOOK REVIEWS

J.C. WINTER, *Bruno Gutmann 1876-1966: A German Approach to Social Anthropology*, Oxford: Clarendon Press 1979. x, 243 pp., Selected Biblio, Index. £14.50.

J.C. Winter has written an important book. The main topic is the impact of preconceived theories upon the organization and presentation of Chagga ethnographic materials in Bruno Gutmann's writings. For the German-speaking *Völkerkundler* it is good and refreshing to hear that Bruno Gutmann was not just a missionary writing incoherently about various ethnographic topics and therefore conspicuously ignored by the ethnological profession in Germany. He developed an original approach to social anthropology and his influence has been visible in recent years in the work, for instance, of Mary Douglas and Victor Turner, and earlier in the writings of L. Lévy-Bruhl, W.I. Thomas, C. Lévi-Strauss and Franz Steiner. For example, it was Gutmann's theory of totemism, the corner-stone of his conceptual system, that seemed to Lévy-Bruhl to provide a basis for his own theory of mystical participation.

Yet Bruno Gutmann is hardly known outside the few specialists interested in East Africa. From 1902 to 1938 Gutmann lived among the Chagga of Kilimanjaro. He wrote several hundred articles and over a dozen books on the Chagga, and his experience in applied anthropology has a special relevance to the policy of Ujamaa in modern Tanzania.

Gutmann was not interested in developing a theory from his experience of Chagga life. On the contrary, he already had a theory, and Winter shows convincingly the various roots of Gutmann's thinking. Gutmann wanted to present his ethnography to the reader in a form that seemed to him meaningful. He took his theoretical assumptions and their implications for granted, and did not care to formulate or to discuss them explicitly. Gutmann was therefore rightly called by Evans-Pritchard 'a social mystic'. Winter's book is an anthropological study of an anthropologist's work. He reconstructs the fundamental concepts of Gutmann's anthropological theory from a wealth of descriptive contexts where they lie hidden: using every scrap of evidence<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> For example, 'Frau Gutmann's ... father ... owned a little farm in the Erzgebirge and operated a petty transport service .... Little Bruno developed a strong attachment to his grandfather's draught-horses and later recalled that the memory of his experience with these animals decisively influenced the conception of his theory of totemism.' (p.30)

the author organizes his material in five chapters: I. Introduction: The 'Depth View', II. The Life of a Missionary: 'Outsider-ship and Integration', III. Social Origins: Totemism. The Creative Emotion, IV. Vitalism and its Cancer: The Theory of Animism, V. Living Social Structure: The Sociology of the 'Primal Ties'.

For Gutmann ethnography was the ideal vehicle for spreading the gospel of his anthropological theories. They were the justification, the motive for his ethnography. Gutmann's theories do not necessarily become any better once their axioms are understood. But a knowledge of their fundamental assumptions will certainly dissolve some of the mist which the mystical verbiage creates between the Chagga and Gutmann's readers.

According to Winter's analysis Gutmann organizes his ethnographic and sociological material in accordance with a vitalist and symbolist approach. His sociology is based on the theory of *Gemeinschaft* (organic life) and *Gesellschaft* (imaginary and mechanical structure) developed by Ferdinand Tönnies, whom Gutmann never mentions. Although Gutmann was critical of fascism, he used some of the *Blut und Boden* concepts. The reader becomes reconciled, however, by the title of one of Gutmann's books *Dichten und Denken der Dschagganeger* which, by its allusion to the bon mot *die Deutschen, ein Volk der Dichter und Denker* openly challenged in 1908 the general colonial preconception that Africans were primitive, savage, uncultured, and at best half human. Winter discusses at great length the very personal, indeed odd, style of Gutmann, which is 'indigestible for non-German readers' and tries to explain terms such as *Spruchrasen*, *Rippler*, *Gliedwesen*, *vergliedert*, etc.

Malcolm Crick writes in *JASO* (X: 3 (1979), p. 143) that anthropologists have an ability to make the strange very familiar. In Bruno Gutmann's writings the ethnographic facts about the Chagga seem very familiar to the reviewer, but Gutmann's implicit theorizing about them reads rather strangely. Winter's sympathetic analysis helps us understand what theoretical use Gutmann made of Chagga ethnographic facts and increases our admiration for Gutmann's *oeuvre*.

ANDREAS KRONENBERG

JOSEPH G. JORGENSEN, *Western Indians: Comparative Environments, Languages, and Cultures of 172 Western American Indian Tribes*, San Francisco: W.H. Freeman and Company 1980. xi, 625 pp., Appendixes, Bibliographies, Indexes, Maps, Illustrations. £29.50.

*Western Indians* is subtitled 'Comparative Environments, Languages and Cultures of 172 Western American Indian Tribes'. Jorgensen however makes no mention of many famous tribes of the Wild West;

for his sample excludes the Great Plains and takes in only the reasonably well recorded peoples of the ca. 250 'ethnic units' west of the Rockies from Yakutat Bay in Alaska to northern Baja California. This concentration permits intensive statistical examination of a sample consisting of 443 variables, ranging from 'salt added to food' to 'charms and magic used to influence gambling'. Jorgensen's project continues a statistical style of comparative studies which derives from Tylor. As such it runs up against familiar difficulties, among them 'Galton's Problem' (what are the statistically independent units suitable for valid comparison) and quandaries about the proper definition of variables. Jorgensen knows where the traps lie and takes steps to avoid them, but even so certain problems in the method may have no solutions. Jorgensen's variables tend to be conventional, terminologies for example being assigned to the Crow and Omaha types. The procedures sometimes lead to odd results: one of the maps demonstrates that for much of the inland western United States, no sea mammals were hunted. But if the reader wishes to know what kinds of digging sticks were used or whether first- or second-cousin marriage was approved, he will find that the relevant maps display visually informative and fairly clear representations of these traits. At the most general level, Jorgensen and his associates found expectably that economic organization, technology, and subsistence economy were much more closely correlated than were other areas of human activity. Politics, warfare, spirit quests, shamanism and so on were most subject to local variation and correlated least well with the other selected topics. Environmental factors influenced but did not determine cultural patterns, which maintained themselves in diverse environments. Furthermore source material demonstrated the 'embeddedness' of economic patterns within other aspects of culture. 'For an anthropologist, no experience can be more instructive about the intertwined nature of economy, kinship, polity, and religion among tribal peoples than reading several hundred ethnographies on 172 tribes.' The reliability of the tests of course depends upon the researchers' ability to accurately extract the information which they read, as well as upon the thoroughness of the ethnographic record. The bibliography in *Western Indians* is perfunctory, but the author claims that the team read every available ethnography and that each researcher independently read practically every source on every tribe in detail (and this in a mere one and one half years). Jorgensen avers that the region may be the best reported in the world, but the reader must write to the author to find out how much information is available for each of the variables for any given tribe. The author, the project editor and the manuscript editor have done their best to assure that the text is acceptable, but the prose, distributed through double columns on 313 large pages, does lie rather heavily on the stomach. The book, which is the first of several volumes, is best used as a reference work. The several appendices, indexes, figures and over 250 maps enhance its usefulness, but there are so many maps and other illustrations that a table of figures should have been provided.

JOHN T. HITCHCOCK, *A Mountain Village in Nepal* (Fieldwork Edition), New York etc.: Holt, Rinehart and Winston 1980 [Case Studies in Cultural Anthropology, general editors George and Louise Spindler]. vii, 143 pp., Select Bibliography. £3.25.

This is a reissue of *The Magars of Banyan Hill* which came out in 1966. It is unchanged except that an extra chapter (previously published in *Being an Anthropologist: Fieldwork in Eleven Cultures*, G. Spindler ed., New York 1970) is added in which Hitchcock describes the fieldwork that was the basis of the rest of the book. His research proposal is also added in an appendix. The book as it originally stood was an excellent, well-written description of life, Magar life in particular, in the more fertile and prosperous parts of the middle hills of Nepal; but it was unlikely to have interested anyone who did not want to know about Magars, Nepal or Hinduisation. The extra chapter changes all that. In the first place, it adds the moving story of the difficulties of fieldwork and the death of the Hitchcocks' 18 month old son. We are also told how it became clear that the original research proposal was misconceived. And finally it provides us with material on the northern Magars which helps to put the Magars of Banyan Hill (who are southern Magars) in context.

As a general rule it would surely be unfair to hold anthropologists to their research proposals. But in this case it is worth examining the proposal in detail because it contains a notion of the tribe as a self-contained culture, a common but misleading view. Its inapplicability to Nepal (as indeed to much of India) is, I think, the real reason that Hitchcock's proposed 'retrospective experiment in adaptive variation' failed; it was not simply that the initial conditions turned out not to hold.

The inspiration for the research project came from Marshall Sahlins' *Social Stratification in Polynesia* (Seattle 1958). Sahlins assumed that the Polynesians had come from the same source with the same culture which had then adapted to 'environments differing as much as high volcanic islands and low atolls that barely rose above the sea'. Differences within their culture could then be traced back to these differences of environment. Hitchcock's idea was to duplicate this situation in Nepal. He assumed that 'divergences in cultural cores will be related to four major variables: (1) cultural genesis of the group; (2) cultural features "offered" by diffusion ... (3) internal innovations; (4) environment.' He would try to hold the first 3 variables constant

by taking a single small tribe as the unit of investigation ... by selecting communities which share the history of the same isolated region, and by selecting communities which at present all are roughly equidistant from important foci of 'outside' influences ... by choice of communities which always have been in fairly intimate contact with each other.

There is some ambiguity in the term 'cultural core'; but the crucial thing is the idea that if the above conditions are satisfied, the differences between the two communities chosen will be the effects of adaptation to different environments.

However, as Hitchcock himself describes, the Nepalese middle hills have been open to influences from the great traditions of India and Tibet for over a millennium, and they have been part of the officially Hindu kingdom of Nepal for 200 years. Where there are cultural models which the tribe is well aware of, and which certain members of the tribe self-consciously imitate, Hitchcock's model of an isolated entity determined by 4 separate variables seems quite inadequate. Features coming from outside (variable 2, above) are not discrete items, such as a new way to make a hammer, but a whole way of life that is perceived as superior. (It may be replied that the term 'cultural core' was meant to refer only to those elements of the culture which are determined by the environment and its exploitation, but this would make the avowed aim of the research - 'to test the hypothesis that two [or more] divergent cultural cores will be found to vary functionally with two [or more] types of environment' - quite trivial.)

Hitchcock describes how the headman of Banyan Hill and certain other Magars have recently been converted to Vaishnavism, a way of being more pious than many Brahmans in the area. But all the Magars in the area have long since accepted Hindu ideas of ritual pollution and caste institutions. His description of the Small Dasain festival and the relation of 'sacred and secular, Brahman and headman' which is implied and reasserted in it, fits the model of *Homo Hierarchicus*.

It is therefore clear that the Magars have not been an isolated community for a long time. Nevertheless, Hitchcock spent much time and trouble in trying to find a community of Ranas and/or Thapas, the sub-tribes represented in the southern Magar community of Banyan Hill. Eventually he had to settle for Monal, a village of Ghartis and Puns. Once there he realised that

these people were too unlike those in Banyan Hill to believe the difference could be accounted for mainly by a single variable - adaptation to differing environments. They spoke a Tibeto-Burman tongue Hem [the southern Magar research assistant] could not understand .... Another of the bedrock assumptions I had wanted to make was that the different Magar groups studied would be aware of one another's ideas. Even this assumption was shaken when I saw how surprised and shocked both Hem and Krishna [also a southern Magar] were to discover that these people would eat a cow if it had died a natural death.

The element that is lacking from the theoretical discussion in the book, though it is there in much of the description of Banyan Hill, is the concept of Hinduisation (also known as Sanskritization). This is surely crucial for understanding the culture of any group in Nepal (with the possible exception of the Bhotiyas and the Sherpas, who have an identity defined by their

relation to a different great tradition, the Tibetan). It would be fascinating to have a detailed comparison of the degrees of Hinduisation of Monal and Banyan Hill. It might then become apparent that environment does indeed have a crucial role to play, though perhaps more of a 'prohibitive' or 'permissive' one than the 'creative' one Hitchcock was interested in investigating. It is likely to be crucial because it determines both geographical proximity to the local representatives of the Hindu great tradition and the wealth that people have, relative wealth being an important asset in the attempt to have one's new and purer identity accepted by others.

DAVID GELLNER

HAIM HAZAN, *The Limbo People: A Study of the Constitution of the Time Universe among the Aged*, London etc.: Routledge and Kegan Paul 1980. vii, 186 pp., Index. £10.50.

Issues concerning the old in our society are sensitive. The non-aged have consequently relegated the aged to another category of species. Certain activities (like sex) are classified as the prerogative of the non-aged. The knowledge that we will all have to cross the boundary into old age without the necessary aids to adjustments in our social relationships or to our inner psychological states is unwelcome.

*The Limbo People* explores and confronts some of these problems. The book, which is the result of work carried out in a London Day Centre for elderly Jewish people, shows that stereotypes of the aged, held by the non-aged, are entirely different from the reality they experience. The aged are seen as being in a static condition - in the peaceful Autumn of life - waiting for death and dwelling nostalgically on past events. In reality, Hazan says, the aged are experiencing the most changeable period of their lives 'a freezing of their social condition'. They suffer bodily deterioration, ill health which often forces them to give up life-long occupations and hobbies, and there are drastic mental re-adjustments to be made. The reciprocal relations usually shared with family and friends are often lost. They are no longer expected to participate in 'dynamic interaction' with the outside world.

In the Day Centre, described by Hazan, the participants re-create a new social environment in an effort to counteract the effects of the outside world, the 'Limbo World' of his title. Time, as it is experienced in the outside world, is rejected and past history is re-constructed. Some nostalgia for past events is allowed but participants are largely discouraged from talking about the past. Photos of grandchildren are discouraged. Death, and departure from the Centre, are seen as the same, and those

involved in either are quickly forgotten. Care and help diminish noticeably in the Limbo World and so, in contrast, in the Centre they become the basis for social relationships and the criteria for the incorporation and acceptance of new members. Ironically these qualities require no reciprocity as they do in the outside world.

Hazan points out that the Centre does not solve the basic problems; society's stereotyping of the aged persists and the old continue to deteriorate physically. He suggests, however, that helping the aged to re-construct a world that naturally continues the previous one and which entails some kind of 'dynamic interaction' with it might be more beneficial than providing physical havens where time is marked by the arrival of the next meal or bedpan.

The book raises interesting questions concerning the awareness of time constructs within our own society and varying perceptions of time within each individual life-span. The main weakness of the book lies in the inadequacy of the Day Centre as an ideal 'model' for examining the problems of the elderly; the age range is wide and some have been admitted because of their disabilities. They are, of course, related by their inability to participate in the 'Limbo World' any longer. The Centre creates a mirror image of the outside world yet, in the book, the 'Limbo World' remains shadowy and insubstantial. Although the book concerns elderly Jewish people its findings would be relevant to any similar group. However, I found it disappointing that its treatment of the adjustments of Jewish people to both past and present did not contain some consideration for the almost obsessive Jewish concern with history - not only because Jewish religion is rooted in a historical covenant but also because of the 'accidents' of history of which Jews seem to be the perpetual victims.

These criticisms are minor and do not detract from the book. It is a welcome contribution to the anthropological consideration of problems of present-day Western society.

PAT HOLDEN

DONALD CORDRY, *Mexican Masks*, Austin: University of Texas Press 1980. xxiv, 259 pp., Bibliography, Coloured Ills., Index, Maps. £24.00.

In what is to date the most comprehensive record of Mexican masks, the late Donald Cordry has combined into one volume some forty years of experience as an ethnographer and artist.

*Mexican Masks* is by any standard a beautiful book, containing over three hundred illustrations most of which are in colour. In many ways it is a testament to Cordry's own life-long fascination with Mexico, for this remarkable collection provides us not

only with an insight into the material culture of Mexico; it also says a great deal about Cordry's eye as a collector. The vast majority of masks pictured come either from his own collection or from collections which he helped build for institutions such as the Museum of the American Indian in New York, the National Museum of Anthropology and History in Mexico City, and the American Museum of Natural History.

Cordry's own selectivity, however, exposes him to certain anthropological criticisms, especially since his perspective is primarily an aesthetic, if not a somewhat curatorial one. Masks, thus considered, comprise a category of objects responsible for a bewildering plethora of meanings since the method of categorization frequently places the social significance (or insignificance) of the phenomenon of masking on a level secondary to the aesthetic contemplation of the objects themselves. While, therefore, most of the masks are beautifully photographed, a much smaller number of plates actually shows them in use. Still, this format is not altogether Cordry's own choice. As the author points out time and again, mask customs die daily in Mexico and all too often a mask surfaces from storage or in a market without anyone recollecting the details of its meaning or function. In these cases we are left only with relics produced by mask-makers for whom carving was often a sacred activity performed only after fasting and with the aid of hallucinogens. That many of these masks are evidence of the limits of the human imagination cannot be doubted; but nor can it be doubted that in general we are yet very far from a full understanding of Mexican masked phenomena. What we are left with in Cordry's work is probably the best document on Mexican masks for some time to come as well as a distinct feeling that a great tradition has collapsed in the lifetime of one man.

DAVID NAPIER

CLAUDIO MARTA, *A Group of Lovara Gypsies Settle down in Sweden: An Analysis of their Acculturation*, Stockholm: University of Stockholm, IMFO-gruppen 1979. 128 pp., Bibliography. No price given.

*The Acculturation of the Lovara*, Stockholm: University of Stockholm, IMFO-gruppen 1979. 31 pp. No price given.

These two books were written by an Italian anthropologist for a Swedish doctorate in the social sciences. They constitute no small problem for the social anthropologist. On the one hand Marta has an excellent case: he addresses himself to one of the most pertinent problems of Western society, that of the treatment of minorities or immigrants; and he has shown both the energy and the courage to continue his work in a sensitive area

of social ethics and practical policies. On the other hand, Marta's analytical skills are less than convincing, and his results are almost devoid of anthropological insight. Nor can he be redeemed merely by his declaration of solidarity with the Lovara Gypsies.

In 1969 Marta, then a student of philosophy in Rome, came into contact with a group of Lovara Gypsies who were settling down in a Roman shanty-town, where he had been working as an unpaid social worker. In this capacity Marta soon found himself committed 'side by side with the Gypsies, to the achievement of their most basic rights: vaccination and schooling for the children, [and] improvement of the hygienic ... conditions of the camp'.

In spring 1971 the Lovara accepted the offer made by the Swedish government to settle in Sweden. Marta eventually accompanied the Lovara to Sweden later that year, and he stayed for two months in the first temporary camp. In 1973 he re-established contact with the Lovara. They consisted of approximately 40 people and it was among these new immigrants to Swedish society that he carried out fieldwork for 15 months in 1974-75, sponsored by the Swedish authorities.

Marta's studies of the Lovara Gypsies leave one with the impression of an extremely favourable anthropological case which could be analyzed with a view not only to their clinical or scientific aims but also to political and pragmatic issues. Potentially, then, Marta's work is of extreme interest because it is placed squarely in the field of tension between theory and practice - or between speculative and 'applied' anthropology. For a Scandinavian like myself Marta's work was of further interest because it could provide us with a much-needed anthropological commentary on what seems to be an increasingly inefficient and even deplorable policy towards immigrants in Scandinavian countries.

These positive expectations unfortunately did not survive the first few pages. The works are totally lacking in anthropological awareness, and leave the impression of theoretical and conceptual incoherence; Marta shows astonishingly little sensitivity even to the Lovara culture which he purports to study. The failings of Marta's work emphasise the urgent need to weed out reports which purport to be anthropology but seem to be quite unaware of what anthropology has become. It would be unfortunate if anthropology were to continue to be represented simply as the study of exotic peoples; it is, rather, a specific field of comprehension based on a particular epistemology, and with a coherent set of concepts springing out from a long tradition of scholarship.

The good points in Marta's work emerge directly from the material - that is to say from the quoted statements of the Lovara, the Swedish welfare workers, and the schoolteachers - rather than from Marta's analysis itself. Marta continually poses the wrong questions. For instance he refers to 'double socialization', and quotes a remark made by a schoolteacher about a Lovara girl, H, that

"It's as if H lived simultaneously in two different worlds. One is the 'world' of her group, the other that of school. In each of the two worlds she has to speak a different language."

Marta reduces this to a problem in personality development. Even his acknowledgement of two different sets of values or ideologies - based on the 'clan' and on 'Magic' on the one hand and on 'individualism and rational thought' on the other - never takes Marta to the point of analyzing the nature of the problem of acculturation as one of a particular relationship between cultures as different systems of meaning. We do not even get a clear impression of the Lovara culture, and Gadjé society (in this case Sweden) is presented as nothing but welfare policy, suppression and prejudice directed against the Lovara, with the aim of effacing Rom culture. Even though Marta's analysis is carried out very much at the surface level of the encounter, he chooses to neglect the explicit wish of the Lovara to settle down in Sweden, to go to school, to get treated as equals of the Swedes, to get permanent jobs so that they could buy their own houses, etc. Would it have been less suppressive, had the Swedish authorities denied the Lovara access to all of these things? Marta leaves us wondering.

The failure to see the majority society as in any way a culture with its own rationality is a problem all the way through Marta's book. It possesses a structure which is impermeable to the reality of 'muted' groups (to borrow the Ardeners' term). It is as a mediator between the dominant and the muted structures, that the role of the anthropologist could have been at once theoretically interesting and practically useful.

Let us see how Marta takes up a particular problem in the encounter between the two 'societies', viz. the Lovara's exposure to Swedish television. Apparently the Lovara's interest in the 'lighter programmes' offered by (the wicked) Swedish television could have 'disastrous consequences not only on their physical but also their mental health' - but we are not told what is meant by 'mental health', or whether it is a psychological or a cultural entity. What we are told is how television 'thus became an instrument of oppression of their awareness', suggesting that the Swedes consciously use this instrument. Yet we are told in the very next sentence that

... they [the Lovara] deliberately chose not to watch the more educational broadcasts which might have helped them form some critical eye to their surroundings.

Thus, useful programmes exist, but the Lovara refuse to watch them. Who is the villain, then, if it is no longer the television programme makers; and what is the relationship between the alleged 'oppression' and the fact that the Lovara 'deliberately' choose the lighter programmes? It would have been interesting to know whether Marta would have thought it less oppressive had the Swedish authorities denied the Lovara access to television

altogether, or had they supplied them with televisions with only one channel, viz. that of the more 'interesting' programmes.

Marta takes the laudable stand that an anthropologist should take the *inside* viewpoint when studying a particular minority as against the host society, that is he should declare himself at the side of the minority group in case of conflict. However, from an anthropological point of view this stand is not honoured. Not only does Marta fail to give the reader any coherent impression of the semantics of the Lovara culture, but more seriously he seems to have misread anthropology and the method of participant observation.

For example, the Swedish family therapist (and the school-teacher quoted above) engaged in finding a job for a young woman among the immigrants showed more awareness of the no-man's-land between two cultures than the anthropologist tape-recording their words. When a job was found for this particular woman, her husband suddenly intervened, forbade her to take it, and told her to stay at home to look after their child. Facing this the family therapist remarked:

"Up against situations like that, I just don't know what to do; should I respect the group's tradition and/or husband's will or should I support the cause of the Gypsy woman's liberation?"

On this honest remark Marta comments:

Thus, the ... therapists' function ended up by having no sense at all as far as the Gypsies were concerned, and there was a serious risk that it would jeopardize the successful outcome of the acculturation process.

We are nowhere told what the 'successful outcome of the acculturation process' would be. It is this incoherence at the conceptual level which is perhaps the most disturbing aspect of Marta's work. It seems incoherent even within its own frame of reference, or phrased more accurately, it lacks a conceptual framework, which could have lent Marta's arguments some unity. Yet Marta seems confident that there is such a thing as a 'correct' approach to cultural transformations:

Only through the widening of their own traditional cultural horizons and the critical integration into the host society, minorities such as the Rom will be able to resist the continuous attacks inflicted upon them by all types - overt or hidden - of imperialism, and to find their place, side by side with other groups of dispossessed, in the struggle for the edification of a truly democratic society. In this sense, anthropological research requires a civil and political commitment.

Not only does he talk about assimilation, integration, and acculturation on one and the same page without revealing what he thinks is the difference between them, but what is worse is

his brief hint as to what a 'widening of their own traditional cultural horizons' might imply:

... it is necessary that he [the anthropologist] contributes to the awakening of the class/ethnos consciousness of the Rom and - I may add - not as an outsider, but as an INSIDER (emphasis in original).

One can very well ask whether we are still dealing with 'their own traditional cultural horizons'. It is likewise very doubtful if Marta could claim to be an 'insider' on that score. Of course, if by 'insider' we refer to a person of good-will with some understanding of the particular culture who is prepared to fight for the people as against the authorities of the host society, it is acceptable. But if we think of the dichotomy inside/outside in a more anthropological way, Marta's statement makes no sense, neither in his own terms (class consciousness, imperialism, and so forth are not part of the inside vocabulary), nor in relation to anthropological discourse in general (where the anthropologist is a mediator between the inside and the outside world).

It is very important that anthropologists acknowledge their responsibility towards the people they study, both at a theoretical and at a practical level. Certainly Marta has had the courage to commit himself to the problems of the Lovara. My misgivings about his work are based on the fact that it is merely glossed over with anthropological terminology. Social work does not become social anthropology because it deals with Gypsies. Marta has not taken the leap from social worker to social anthropologist.

KIRSTEN HASTRUP

JAMES J. FOX (ed.), *The Flow of Life: Essays on Eastern Indonesia*, Cambridge, Mass. & London: Harvard University Press 1980 [Harvard Studies in Cultural Anthropology, general editors David Maybury-Lewis *et al.*]. viii, 355 pp., Index, Illustrations. £18.00.

In his doctoral thesis, published in 1935,<sup>1</sup> the Dutch ethnologist F.A.E. van Wouden identified several prominent features of Eastern Indonesian societies as the core of an ancient Indonesian civilisation, traces of which were still to be found among the cultures of the area as described by nineteenth- and twentieth-century

---

<sup>1</sup> *Sociale Structuurtypen in de Grootte Oost*, published in English translation by R. Needham as *Types of Social Structure in Eastern Indonesia*, The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff 1968.

ethnographers, missionaries, and administrators. While the objectives of comparative research in this region have changed since van Wouden's time, the essays included in the present volume - which as the editor notes is the first comparative study of Eastern Indonesia to appear since van Wouden's thesis - manifest as a whole the same concerns as those van Wouden himself focussed upon, namely, asymmetric alliance (or 'exclusive cross-cousin marriage' as he called it), symbolic classification, dyadic and triadic modes of representation, and diarchy or dual sovereignty. This continuity of interests is to a large extent attributable to the nature of Eastern Indonesian societies themselves; and as Fox mentions in the Introduction, the international group of contributors to this volume, most of whom carried out fieldwork in Indonesia during the 'sixties or early 'seventies, do not otherwise share any strict unanimity of views or belong to a single school of thought. Nevertheless the far-reaching influence of van Wouden's many insights is apparent throughout this book, which Fox thus describes as both a tribute to and assessment of van Wouden's work. It should therefore be of interest not only to Indonesianists but to anyone concerned with alliance, exchange, the relation between myth, ritual, and social structure - and related topics of current anthropological enquiry.

The first part of this volume is entitled 'Marriage, Alliance, and Exchange', and the second part 'Systems of Social and Symbolic Classification', thereby reflecting the two major concerns of van Wouden's study. As van Wouden himself showed, however, there can be no absolute separation between the social and the symbolic. The division is thus more a matter of convenience than of method; and indeed, certain themes, most noticeably that of exchange, are explored throughout the volume. One problem raised directly or indirectly by several contributors is that of variation within basic patterns of social and conceptual order. In the opening essay of Part One, Needham confronts this question in the realm of social organisation by isolating five features - drawn from relationship terminology, marriage rules, and institutions - that appear to vary more or less continuously (roughly as one moves from east to west) between the domains of western Sumba. The variations found in this region, he suggests, represent different 'instants in a general process of structural change', which might be viewed as a linear, evolutionary series of transformations, within a general pattern founded on six principles that are basic to Sumbanese social life. The only shortcoming I can find in Needham's exemplary analysis is that what he means by 'asymmetric prescriptive alliance' (with the emphasis on 'prescriptive') is not always made clear. Thus, while he has elsewhere maintained that prescription is to be defined with reference to terminology, Needham states that asymmetric prescriptive alliance is practised in several western Sumbanese domains, whereas the terminology employed in these regions, according to the sources he cites, does not support this.

The essay by Gordon, which follows, also touches upon the notion of prescription, as it has been applied to Manggarai society. Specifically, Gordon contends that the contrast between a symmetric prescriptive terminology and asymmetric marriage by which Needham (in *Sociologus* XVI (1966), pp. 141-157) has characterized the Manggarai system is spurious, since the terminology, though symmetric in certain particulars, is not prescriptive. Gordon, however, bases his argument on little more than the fact that, while MB=FZH=WF=HF and FZ=MBW=W=HM, cross-cousins in Manggarai are not distinguished from parallel-cousins and siblings. The rest of the paper is then taken up with a description of institutional and ceremonial accompaniments of marriage and an unnecessarily elaborate demonstration of the evident fact that in the Manggarai marriage system any group partakes simultaneously in a number of different sorts of affinal relations, neither of which clearly relates to what is apparently Gordon's main point. This is unfortunate, particularly as the Manggarai case could have been used to raise what seems to me an important analytical question, namely, how many and what kinds of terminological equations and distinctions need be present before a terminology as a whole can usefully be characterized as prescriptive.

Barnes's paper on alliance in Kédang is largely an expansion of certain conclusions of his 1974 monograph. Among the most important of these, from a comparative point of view, is that while Kédang has both a social order of asymmetric prescriptive alliance and corporate descent groups (in this case patrilineal clans), the latter do not operate as alliance groups, so that 'the system does not function as a whole'. One possible reason for this, Barnes suggests, is that Kédang clans are not political corporations and therefore marriages between their members do not serve political ends. In this regard, Kédang contrasts in an interesting way with the Rotinese domain of Thie, described in the following paper by Fox. In Thie, as elsewhere on Roti, marriage is not governed by a categorical prescription nor is bridewealth the collective responsibility of clans as in Kédang. Yet Thie clans are titled political units, grouped into moieties which are further divided, and marriage in Thie is supposed to accord with these divisions. By applying the notion of alliance to a system in which the marriage rule - moiety exogamy from which one part of one moiety is exempted - amounts to a purely negative injunction, Fox extends the analytical use of this term to non-prescriptive systems in an interesting way. His essay, which has a great deal besides to recommend it, also provides an illuminating instance of the relation between dyadic and tripartite aspects of Eastern Indonesian social structure. Clamagirand's sketch of the social organisation of the Ema of Timor illustrates yet another variation on the themes of prescriptive alliance and the political implications of the alliance relation. She distinguishes between a 'private domain' in which 'core houses', the senior segments of patrilineal clans, are involved in a network of asymmetric marriage relations, and a 'communal domain' involving a hierarchy of core houses, grouped into an

eastern and western division, and a group of three chiefly houses, which partake in a system of marriage alliances at a higher, more inclusive level of organisation.

Both in Kédang and among the Ema, the exchange of women in marriage is viewed as a 'flow of life', the phrase taken as the title of this volume. The last two papers in Part One deal more specifically with exchange, as it is expressed in ritual practice and ideology as well as in social arrangements. Forman examines marriage and mortuary practices among the Makassae of East Timor and shows that these are founded on a common ideology that incorporates exchange as a prominent principle. One point of significance of his essay, taken in connexion with the others, is that it reveals a good deal of similarity with regard to categories and ideology between the Makassae, who do not speak an Austronesian language or practise prescriptive alliance, and other Eastern Indonesian peoples who do. This is also true of Friedberg's paper on the non-Austronesian Bunaq (though the Bunaq do practise prescriptive alliance). Valeri, writing on the Huaulu of Seram, focusses upon marriage prestations. Since gifts made by wife-givers and wife-takers, while distinct in kind, exactly balance one another, he characterizes the exchange of these valuables as reciprocal and symmetric, in contrast to the unilateral transfer of women in marriage, which is non-reciprocal and asymmetric. Valeri then goes on to discuss the social implications of the relation between what he sees as the symmetrical and asymmetrical aspects of Huaulu marriage.

This is an appropriate place to mention that, as Valeri's essay is the only one which deals with a society in the Moluccas, an area to which van Wouden paid a good deal of attention, in this respect the volume suffers from a slight imbalance. Moreover, of the 13 other ethnographic essays six concern Timorese societies while five deal with speakers of languages belonging to the Bima-Sumba group, namely, Sumbanese, Savunese, and Manggarai.

By the end of Part One the reader will have become aware of a number of recurring themes that connect different Eastern Indonesian societies, in particular the analogous conception of the human body, society, and the cosmos; and the extensive use of the same paired categories, such as male and female. The essays in Part Two further explore these themes and thus bear further witness to van Wouden's seminal observation that in Eastern Indonesia the cosmos and human society are organised in the same way.

In his description of ideas and usages connected with livestock mainly in the western part of Sumba, Onvlee demonstrates once again the intimate connexion between the exchange of goods and social structure; his paper thus serves as a useful transition between the first two parts of the volume. Also writing on Sumba, Adams attempts to show how three major ordering principles manifest in the design of decorated textiles are also present in other areas of Sumbanese culture. Perhaps in part because, through fieldwork, I am personally familiar with Sumba, this is

for me one of the most disappointing contributions to the volume, and I feel that rather more could have been done with the topic Adams has chosen. Many of the parallels she adduces, moreover, seem trivial and factitious. Thus, to cite one example, while there is an undeniable isomorphism between the tripartite division of major villages and the three-part composition of decorated textiles, each of which, as Adams correctly notes, also incorporates a dyadic aspect, the analogy she suggests between these forms and other instances of what she identifies as a 'dyadic-triadic set' - the triad of wife-giver, ego-group, and wife-taker; the practice of two regional groups meeting at a spatially intermediate spot to engage in trade; and the use of ritual speakers to mediate between two groups - appears to be at best tenuous. In addition, the relation between the dyadic and (supposedly) triadic aspects of these arrangements is not clearly shown to be comparable between different instances.

Nico Kana's essay on the Savunese house provides a valuable addition to earlier analyses of the house as a social and symbolic structure in Eastern Indonesian societies (see for example essays by Cunningham and Fox in R. Needham (ed.), *Right and Left*, Chicago 1973). The papers by Schulte Nordholt and Francillon, which follow, discuss the same sorts of categories as those uncovered by Kana and other contributors, as these occur in the classifications of western Timorese societies. Schulte Nordholt's essay, which begins with a useful, and in part autobiographical, assessment of the influence of van Wouden's work, deals with transformations of the relationship between paired categories - in particular male and female - as these are applied in different contexts and in ways that emphasize different associations or aspects of the categories and relationships in question. Francillon, who considers the recent political history of Wehali in the South Belu area of Timor, concentrates on binary symbolism in connexion with diarchical rule, and the inconsistency between traditional and colonial leadership resulting from the failure of the Dutch to grasp the true nature of Timorese governance. Of particular interest is Francillon's suggestion that the matriliney of Wehali society can be attributed to the position of this domain within a larger political and symbolic whole, by which Wehali is opposed to peripheral princedoms that display a complementary masculine principle, as expressed *inter alia* in patrilineal institutions.

The importance of masculinity and femininity and related categories on Timor is further illustrated in Friedberg's essay on myths and rites connected with agriculture among the Bunaq and Traube's paper on the Mambai. Traube explores the contextually varying significations and associations of 'white' and 'black' as categories of ritual action, in order to demonstrate an elaborate language of opposition which orders and unifies diverse realms of Mambai experience. Traube's paper, in particular, also attests to the widespread tradition of semantic parallelism in ritual language in Eastern Indonesia.

The two essays that make up Part Three are both methodological, focussing in particular on the 'field of ethnological study'

approach advocated by van Wouden's teacher, J.P.B. de Josselin de Jong, and implicitly followed in his 1935 thesis by van Wouden himself. In the first paper P.E. de Josselin de Jong reviews the advances and limitations of this method, relating it to the wider question of comparison in social anthropology and the problem of history. Fox, in the concluding essay, discusses the development of comparative research in Eastern Indonesia. His main point - and one that is borne out by the essays in this volume - is that a common structural core, a unifying pattern of Eastern Indonesian culture that can accommodate variations encountered in individual societies, is to be located in the realm of categories rather than in the field of institutional arrangements. Being principally concerned with the latter, van Wouden, on the other hand, based his formal model of an ancient Indonesian civilisation - in essence a system of exclusive cross-cousin marriage involving phratries, marriage classes, and double unilineal descent - on certain predefined elements of social organisation. Yet, as Fox notes, more recent ethnography (including van Wouden's own research in Kodi (in *Bijdragen* CXII (1956), pp.204-246), which showed asymmetric alliance - or exclusive cross-cousin marriage - and double unilineal descent to be inversely related) has placed his model more and more in doubt.

In this regard, it is arguable that the volume as a whole could have brought out more the major shortcomings of van Wouden's theory. (The need for such criticism has recently been shown by the attempts of the linguist Robert Blust to reconstruct mainly from linguistic evidence a Proto-Austronesian social order (in *Current Anthropology* XXI (1980), pp. 205-247). In this endeavour Blust has tended to treat van Wouden's thesis as established fact, valid not only for Eastern Indonesia but for the Austronesian-speaking world as a whole.) This, however, does not detract from van Wouden's many insights into the nature of Eastern Indonesian culture, nor from the merits of the individual essays included in the present volume.

GREGORY L. FORTH

P U B L I C A T I O N S      R E C E I V E D

- Academia Sinica* No. 45, Spring 1978; No. 46, Autumn 1978; No. 47, Spring 1979; No. 48, Autumn 1979.
- AMARSHI, Azeem; GOOD, Kenneth; and MORTIMER, Rex, *Development and Dependency: The Political Economy of Papua New Guinea*, Melbourne etc.: Oxford University Press 1979. xviii, 261 pp., Bibliography, Index. £12.50.
- Anthropology Tomorrow: The Chicago Review of Anthropology* Vol. XII, No. 1, 1979.
- ARIS, Michael; and Aung San Suu Kyi (eds.), *Tibetan Studies in Honour of Hugh Richardson*, Warminster: Aris & Phillips 1980 [Proceedings of the International Seminar on Tibetan Studies, Oxford 1979]. xx, 348 pp. £12.00 (Paper).
- Asia and Africa Today* [Moscow], No. 5, 1980.
- BOURDILLON, M.F.C.; and FORTES, Meyer (eds.), *Sacrifice*, London: Academic Press 1980. xix, 133 pp., Bibliography, Author Index. £7.80.
- Chicago Anthropology Exchange* [formerly *Anthropology Tomorrow*] Vol. XII, No. 2, 1979; and Vol. XIII, No. 1, 1980.
- FOX, James J. (ed.), *The Flow of Life: Essays on Eastern Indonesia*, Cambridge, Mass. & London: Harvard University Press 1980 [Harvard Studies in Cultural Anthropology, general editors David Maybury-Lewis *et al.*]. viii, 355 pp., Index, Illustrations. £18.00.
- GLASSER, Morton; and PELTO, Gretel H., *The Medical Merry-Go-Round: A Plea for Reasonable Medicine*, New York: Redgrave 1980. 167 pp. No price given.
- GONZALEZ, Nancy L. Solien, *Black Carib Household Structure: A Study of Migration and Modernization*, Seattle & London: University of Washington Press 1980 [The American Ethnological Society, ed. Robert F. Spencer, Monograph 48]. xx, 142 pp., Bibliography, Index, Illustrations. £4.50 (Paper).
- GREENBERG, Joseph; HYMES, Dell; and FRIEDRICH, Paul, *On Linguistic Anthropology: Essays in Honor of Harry Hoijer*, Malibu: Undena Publications 1980 for the UCLA Department of Anthropology [Other Realities, ed. Jacques Maquet, vol. 2]. 131 pp. \$9.00 (Paper).
- HOWELL, Evelyn, *Mizh: A Monograph on Government's Relations with the Mahsud Tribe* [1931], with a S. Ahmed, Karachi etc.: Oxford University Press 1979. [Oxford in Asia Historical Reprints from Pakistan]. xii, 119 pp., Map. £6.50.

- International Family Planning Perspectives* Vol. VI, Nos. 1, 2 & 3, 1980.
- JEROME, Norge W. *et al.* (eds.), *Nutritional Anthropology: Contemporary Approaches to Diet and Culture*, Pleasantville: Redgrave 1980. viii, 363 pp., Bibliography. \$12.80 (Paper).
- JORGENSEN, Joseph G., *Western Indians: Comparative Environments, Languages, and Cultures of 172 Western American Indian Tribes*, San Francisco: W.H. Freeman 1980. xi, 625 pp., Bibliography, Index, Maps, Illustrations. £29.50.
- Journal of the Steward Anthropological Society* Vol. XI, No. 1, 1979 [Urbana, Illinois].
- MAILS, Thomas E., *Sundancing at Rosebud and Pine Ridge*, Sioux Falls, South Dakota: The Center for Western Studies 1978, distributed by The University of Nebraska Press. xii, 393 pp., Illustrations. £19.80.
- MILLER, Joseph C. (ed.), *The African Past Speaks: Essays on Oral Tradition and History*, Folkestone: Dawson; Hamden: Archon 1980. xii, 279 pp., Index, Maps, Illustrations. £17.00.
- MOORE, Lorna G.; VAN ARSDALE, Peter W.; GUTTENBERG, Joann E.; and ALDRICH, Robert A., *The Biocultural Basis of Health: Expanding Views of Medical Anthropology*, St. Louis etc.: C.V. Mosby 1980. x, 269 pp., Index, Illustrations. £8.25 (Paper).
- OBBO, Christine, *African Women: Their Struggle for Economic Independence*, London: Zed Press 1980. x, 166 pp. £12.95.
- OBERG, Kalervo, *The Social Economy of the Tlingit Indians*, Seattle & London: University of Washington Press 1980 [The American Ethnological Society, ed. Robert F. Spencer, Monograph 55]. xvi, 138 pp., Bibliography, Index, Illustrations. £4.50 (Paper).
- ORTNER, Sherry B., *Sherpas Through Their Rituals*, Cambridge etc.: Cambridge University Press 1978 [Cambridge Studies in Cultural Systems, ed. Clifford Geertz, No. 2]. xii, 185 pp., Bibliography, Index, Illustrations. £3.50 (Paper).
- ÖSTÖR, Ákos, *The Play of the Gods: Locality, Ideology, Structure and Time in the Festivals of a Bengali Town*, Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press 1980. viii, 236 pp., Index. £16.20.
- PARIN, Paul; MORGENTHALER, Fritz; and PARIN-MATTHEY, Goldy, *Fear Thy Neighbor as Thyself: Psychoanalysis and Society among the Anyi of West Africa* (trans. Patricia Klammerth), Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press 1980. xv, 393 pp., Index. £16.80.

- Population Reports* Vol. VIII, Nos. 3, 4 & 5, 1980 [Population Information Program, The Johns Hopkins University].
- SANSOM, Basil, *The Camp at Wallaby Cross*, Canberra: Australian Institute of Aboriginal Studies 1980. vii, 267 pp., Index. \$12.95.
- SCODITTI, Giancarlo G., *Fragmenta Ethnographica*, New York & Rome: Giancarlo Serafini 1980. 118 pp., Index, Illustrations. No price given.
- SMITH, G. Hubert, *The Explorations of the La Vérendryes in the Northern Plains, 1738-43* (ed. W. Raymond Wood), Lincoln & London: University of Nebraska Press 1980. xvii, 152 pp., Index, Illustrations. £8.40.
- Social Sciences* [USSR Academy of Sciences, Moscow] Vol. IX, No. 4, 1978.
- SPENDER, Dale, *Man Made Language*, London etc.: Routledge & Kegan Paul 1980. xi, 235 pp., Bibliography, Index. £4.95 (Paper).
- TAPPER, Richard, *Pasture and Politics: Economics, Conflict and Ritual Among Shahsevan Nomads of Northwestern Iran*, London etc.: Academic Press 1979 [Studies in Anthropology, ed. E.A. Hammel]. xiii, 261 pp., Appendices, Index, Maps, Illustrations. £17.00.
- VAN WILLIGEN, John, *Anthropology in Use: A Bibliographic Chronology of the Development of Applied Anthropology*, Pleasantville: Redgrave 1980. 322 pp., Index. No price given.
- WALKER, James R., *Lakota Belief and Ritual* (eds. Raymond J. De Mallie & Elaine A. Jahner), Lincoln & London: University of Nebraska Press 1980. xxix, 305 pp., Bibliography, Index. £12.90.
- WILSON, Peter J., *Man, The Promising Primate: The Conditions of Human Evolution*, New Haven & London: Yale University Press 1980. xiii, 169 pp., Index. £8.20.
- [World Fertility Survey & International Statistical Institute]:  
*Occasional Papers*, No. 22, 1980.  
*Scientific Reports*, No. 8, 1980 (revised ed.).  
*Technical Bulletins*, Nos. 6, 7 & 9, 1980.  
*World Fertility Survey*, Summaries of Findings: No. 16 (Czechoslovakia), No. 24 (Flemish findings), No. 26 (Kenya), & No. 27 (Jamaica).