

## BOOK REVIEWS

DAVID F. GREENBERG, *The Construction of Homosexuality*, Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press 1989. x, 499pp., References, Index. £23.95.

This book richly merits the epithet 'magisterial' accorded it by its dust-jacket blurb. It is packed with ethnography, both social and historical facts. Greenberg points out that for an author to write the kind of book he has written by consulting primary sources would be unfeasible; so, quite legitimately, he relies upon the experts (so far as this reviewer is able to judge uncontroversially and fully). He is thus able to range over societies from all parts of the world and from all periods back as far as thousands of years before Christ. In doing so, he presents fascinating pictures of the forms that homosexuality can take, and of the reactions of different groups, some of which (like the Church) included homosexuals, to it. In so doing, Greenberg is scrupulous in the weighing of evidences and in pointing out to his readers the factual fragility of some of the material he must rely upon.

*The Construction of Homosexuality* does not set out merely to record or to encyclopaedize, it seeks to explain why homosexuality has taken different forms socially and why these forms have sometimes incurred the displeasure of other groups (manifested in sometimes horrible and ugly sentences for those found guilty of some homosexual, but not exclusively homosexual, act or acts). The author does so by focusing on a set of questions such as: 'Why were some people tolerant and others highly intolerant? How had Western civilization come to be so repressive?' (pp. 483-4).

To help demonstrate the significance of these questions and of the answers to which they lead - explicated in eleven chapters, spread over two Parts, with titles like 'Inequality and the State: Homosexual Innovations in Archaic Civilizations', 'The Medicalization of Homosexuality', and 'Bureaucracy and Homosexuality' - Greenberg first clears the theoretical ground: functionalism, "cultural-transmission" theory, psychoanalytic theory, and theory that suggests that perceptions and responses to homosexuality are determined by a society's social structure, are disposed of elegantly and eruditely for their manifest inadequacies.

The analyses Greenberg conducts, however, lead him to change his initial set of questions that are essentialist in tone; he stresses the historical variability of conceptions of homosexuality. Looking at homosexuality in this way, which Greenberg rightly claims does not commit him to total relativism, allows the author to show how societies construct this aspect of their social life, which is connected with other important social processes and shifts in the directions of thought. *The*

*Construction of Homosexuality* is thus a contribution to sociology and to the history of ideas.

The 'social constructivist', as exemplified by Greenberg, is interested, that is, in ideas and practice, the macro- and the micro-sociological. This approach, which also introduces psychology into its models when it is thought helpful to do so, may not be so very new to many *JASO* readers, but it is quite a statement - 'an alternative approach' indeed - from a sociologist. Perhaps everyone is doing social anthropology now.

Greenberg acknowledges two general debts that *The Construction of Homosexuality* owes. One is to those who have written usefully about the matters relevant to Greenberg's investigations. This implicit debt is discharged by copious footnotes and by the references which run to over 110 pages of cited works in three European languages. The reader owes Greenberg a debt of gratitude for having compiled this lengthy bibliography. The other debt, which is made explicit, is to the Gay Liberation movement, particularly in the United States but not only there, over the past fifteen years or so, which 'has vastly broadened the scope of scholarly writing on homosexuality' (p. 5). As important as anything, but dejecting to contemplate, is that, in the processes analyzed in the concluding chapter of the book, gay liberation has weakened prejudice enough to permit scholars to publish on the topic without committing professional suicide. Such was the climate even within universities so little time ago.

For all its scholarship and rigour, elegance and erudition, though, *The Construction of Homosexuality* does not forget the processes of which it is itself a part. Thus 'picketing Anita Bryant', leader of the 'Save Our Children' campaign, who announced that 'God puts homosexuals in the same category as murderers', is said to be an *appropriate* response - along with such responses, in different contexts, as religious penitence, psychoanalysis, imprisonment, sterilization, sacramental intercourse, or, one dares add in its twentieth-anniversary year, gay pride; though Greenberg shows how efforts to promote homosexual rights go back to the late nineteenth century in Britain and to the twenties in America - even if it was not until 1961 in the States (in Illinois) and 1967 in England that the legal tide began to turn and homosexual relations in private between consenting adults were decriminalized.

It would not be possible for any author writing on this topic now, and especially perhaps for someone like Greenberg who teaches sociology in New York, not to mention AIDS. As Greenberg mildly puts it: 'the AIDS epidemic complicates the future of homosexuality [and homosexualists] in a number of ways' (p. 478). In the short run, AIDS has probably not changed the way most people think about homosexuality, though it has provided a new focal point for anti-gay diatribes, and violence has apparently been done to some homosexuals by heterosexuals who must now take steps to avoid it in the belief that AIDS is a "gay plague".

ANDREW DUFF-COOPER

PHILIPPE BORGEAUD, *The Cult of Pan in Ancient Greece* (transl. Kathleen Atlass and James Redfield), Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press 1989. xi, 273 pp., Bibliography, Index, Figures, Plates. £33.95 / £13.50.

When the Persians landed at Marathon, according to Herodotus, the Athenians dispatched a long-distance runner to Sparta to ask for immediate military support. On his way back to Athens - bearing the Spartan reply that no troops could be sent because of religious restrictions which bound them until after the next full moon - this runner was crossing the mountains of Arcadia when Pan appeared to him. Pan demanded to know why the Athenians paid no attention to his cult. He claimed that he had always been favourable to Athenians and that he would remain so in the future. After their triumph over the Persians the Athenians duly consecrated a sanctuary to Pan in a cave at the base of the Acropolis.

This story, repeated by later writers, represents just about the only substantial piece of indigenous commentary on one of the central phenomena which Borgeaud attempts to understand in this book: how and why did the cult of Pan expand from Arcadia, Pan's homeland, to Attica and most other parts of Greece in the classical period?

Borgeaud contends that in order to interpret this expansion one must fully comprehend what Pan stood for and what his place was within Greek theology. This work is thus not exclusively about the 'cult' of Pan and how it was practised or how it spread. From the perspectives of archaeology, classical philology and the history of religions this study summarizes virtually every shred of testimony concerning Pan in Ancient Greece. The original title of the French edition, *Recherches sur le dieu Pan* (1979), indicates this objective most accurately.

Borgeaud determines that Pan, a shepherd who himself has goat features, was essentially a mediatory figure who governed the boundaries between savagery and civilization, between panic and reasonable behaviour. His province, Arcadia, was thought to be a truly rude, backward place where people ate acorns, not milled grain. It was famed for its shepherds and warriors, and some held that the Arcadians only tenuously gripped civility, thanks to the pacifying effect of their sweet flute-playing. The associations surrounding Pan were thus replicated in the associations attached to the landscape of Arcadia and to the people who inhabited that landscape. All were marginal and any one could stand for the others.

Borgeaud's discussion of the Greek word *eschatai*, 'edges' (p. 60), helps us to grasp Pan's liminality. That this was the area patrolled by the *ephebes*, young men doing mandatory military service, adds further to Borgeaud's ample documentation that Pan figured in initiatory contexts. He was frequently depicted leading a dance, playing music or inspiring 'panic marriage' (*panos gamos*), a surprising form of rape. In numerous myths and in the public arts, Pan was sometimes portrayed as a spectator. His mere presence, Borgeaud contends, served as a sort of modal marker which indicated that the action being witnessed was charged and boundary-breaking.

The cult of Pan spread beyond Arcadia at a time when cities (*poleis*) were becoming important and lawmakers such as Cleisthenes were promoting reforms aimed at establishing more integration between the city and the surrounding countryside. The time of rich urban landlords exploiting rural fiefs was giving way to the ideal of the citizen farmer who held land simultaneously at both the centre and the periphery of the *polis*. Pan, who was worshipped only in temples in Arcadia, came, at this time, to be worshipped strictly in caves, first on the Acropolis and then in the countryside surrounding Athens. Here is a good case of the insiders' outsider becoming the outsiders' insider. The cult of Pan appears to have been observed by all sorts of people, rich and poor, urban and rural. That was the mark of its success; it integrated these various social spheres and smoothed the transition to the form of social organization which the *polis* required.

This is an interesting hypothesis, but one so general as to be difficult to test critically. Any evidence of the spread of the cult of Pan in the classical period automatically fits it, because this was the period of the *polis*. No attempt is made to locate an area unmarked by the *polis* form of organization to see if Pan did not catch on. Instead, Borgeaud offers rationalizations such as the following: 'Pan's success in Attica - and in other regions of the Hellenic world - at the beginning of the fifth century could reflect at least in part the need officially to recognize and revalue an ancestral religious practice that, after civil neglect or transformation, now seemed to be owed some form of reparation' (p. 179). Exactly who 'owed' what to whom and why is far from clear. The implication seems to be that urban growth and the preoccupation with the Persian War had entailed a neglect of Athens' agricultural-pastoral way of life. The spontaneous acceptance of Pan after Marathon, then, compensated for this neglect. This is a plausible scenario, but it does assume a very logical progression from socio-economic organization, to political ideology to religious symbolism.

Ultimately it probably does not matter greatly if Borgeaud's hypothesis is right or wrong. It has enabled him to organize and present an impressive and stimulating study which offers an unusual entry to the emotional and sexual lives of Greeks in the classical period.

CHARLES STEWART

LEE SIEGEL, *Laughing Matters: Comic Tradition in India*, Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press 1987. xviii, 464pp., Figures, Illustrations, Bibliography, Indexes. £27.95.

At the end of this long but highly readable work, Lee Siegel writes: 'in general, translators have shied away from Sanskrit comic literature because, it seems, they have felt it was trivial, distasteful, pornographic, or untranslatable. I share in that

feeling, but, in my case, those qualities have drawn me to that literature and inspired my attempts to translate it.' Siegel's style has a certain family resemblance to that of Wendy O'Flaherty's. It has the same breathless piling of example upon example, the same racy translations from myriad Sanskrit texts, and the same impatience with the pedantic forms of scholarship (there are no footnotes, no precise references to many of the Western sources cited, no careful citings of opposing views, no attempts to separate out historical layers within the construct 'classical India'). Unlike O'Flaherty's myths, however, most of the jokes are relatively short; the punchlines keep flowing thick and fast. The book is, at one and the same time, self-reverential, self-mocking and self-decentering, with a lightness of touch and accessibility which anthropological fans of post-modernism never seem to attain. The only part of the book where he discusses other scholars' opinions is in a section on the *vidūṣaka*, the clown or fool of Sanskrit drama: this is done in the form of a play, with the scholars spouting quotations of their own works and the *vidūṣaka* making ribald comments on them.

None the less, in spite of all Siegel's disclaimers, this is a work of scholarship as well as a comic and expository *tour de force*. An enormous amount of material is presented from Sanskrit sources, and much of it made me laugh out loud. In between, Siegel mixes in accounts of encounters he has had in India over the years, both with Indians and a few Westerners, in which they have told him jokes, or argued with him about the nature of comedy. Some of these conversations are, cannot but be, fictionalized; though losing something in the telling, these too are very funny.

The final chapter is entirely told in the first person, and relates a trip to India in 1983. It begins with an Indian immigration official telling him that there is nothing funny in India, and ends with him leaving, and another official telling him what a wonderful project his is, and how much humour there is in India. The tag at the beginning of one of this chapter's sections quotes the report of an anonymous reader (presumably an anthropologist) on his book, particularly the final chapter: 'the way he went about his search for humour in modern India was fundamentally flawed, as it took place through the medium of English exclusively, dealt heavily with the printed word (in English) and with chance street and cocktail-party kinds of encounters'. Anthropologists may fancy they recognize the voice of a female sociologist from Delhi University, whom he met at one of these parties, who asked him what his standards for judging Indian humour were, and whether he found Peter Sellers's Indian accent funny.

Elsewhere in the book, Siegel bemoans his inability to tap the vernacular traditions of Indian comedy. Still, if he had read through works on Indian anthropology remotely as assiduously as he sought for Western parallels to use as epigrams for his section headings, he would surely have found material to substantiate his claim that ancient Indian comic themes resurface today. One thinks of Srinivas's account of humour in *The Remembered Village*: some of the gloriously vulgar jokes recounted there would have fitted perfectly into the requisite sections of *Laughing Matters*.

Siegel's main aims are to prove that there is comedy in India, and secondly, that, allowing for the inevitable cultural variability in the triggers of laughter, the basic comic themes are universal. The former claim he triumphantly exemplifies. The latter argument is presented in discussion with various interlocutors through the book: 'When I was studying Sanskrit love poetry, I don't think it ever aroused me,' he tells one of them, 'but I've laughed at lots of things in the farces, and I think Kṣemendra is very, very funny. I rank him with Jonathan Swift.' In the end, however, it is the sheer number of examples which force you into submission, rather than any argument.

Alongside these two big themes, he makes numerous smaller telling points. The persistent link between comedy and religion, whether laughing *at* religion, or laughter *as* religion, is one such. The satires on greedy Brahmans and lusty Buddhist and Jain monks are perhaps predictable, but the way in which they are done is both funny and interesting. I particularly liked his demonstration that comedy depends on context: the same verse occurring in a Buddhist Tantric scripture is holy and profound, while in a farce it would be deeply comic.

The book falls into two main parts, following an Indian taxonomy which divides comedy into satire, that is laughing at others, and humour, that is laughing at oneself. The chapters mostly take their names from Indian gods, thus 'The Laughter of Ganesa', 'The Laughter of Siva', and so on. Quite how far, or how seriously, one is supposed to take this typology I am not sure. Some parts of it are perhaps more convincing than others. What is certain is that no one working on anything to do with comedy in South Asia will be able to ignore Siegel's contribution. In fact anyone interested in comedy anywhere is assured of a good read and a good laugh.

DAVID N. GELLNER

ANN GRODZINS GOLD, *Fruitful Journeys: The Ways of Rajasthani Pilgrims*, Berkeley etc.: University of California Press 1988. xviii, 307pp., Tables, Maps, Illustrations, Glossary, References, Index. \$37.50.

This is an evocative and detailed account of the different types of pilgrimage undertaken by Rajasthani villagers, and the ways in which they are associated with local understandings of life and death. Gold's analysis is unusual both in taking as its primary focus the Hindu householders of a single village (rather than a religious centre, its officiants and its pilgrims), and in its emphasis on vernacular oral and written tradition for explicating meaning; in both respects it prompts comparison with Wadley's work. The style of writing, though, is closer to personal narrative than standard ethnographic monograph, and this makes the book unusually pleasant to read. The only drawback here is the impression of direct

reportage given (intentionally?) by this limited reflexivity, for the anthropologist's representation of herself as actor is, of course, itself a construction of her text.

The book is a rewritten version of Gold's Ph.D. thesis, completed at the University of Chicago. Since Redfield's work in the 1950s, Chicago scholars have been prominent in attempts to explore the relations between Hindu textual doctrine and popular religious belief and practice. In both its achievements and its shortcomings *Fruitful Journeys* may be placed squarely within this academic context. The Introduction explains that Gold's 'original and lofty purpose' (p. 3) was to explore the concept of *moksa* in the lives of ordinary Hindu householders. Pilgrimage, as a potential means of achieving the aim of this spiritual release from the cycle of rebirth, was taken as the setting for this exploration. Although she learnt that pursuit of *moksa* seemed to be of little import to villagers and was rarely an aim of pilgrimage, Gold holds that *moksa* does form part of the general and intimate associations that she found to exist between pilgrimage and death. Her account, however, appropriately focuses mainly on aspects of pilgrimage in relation to the general preoccupation with forms of death rather than with ultimate release from it.

The chapter on 'Responses to Mortality' presents texts of local songs and a description of post-death rituals to elucidate the author's discussion of different forms of existence after death. An account of the Nath cult of Hinglaj Mata - assisted by the admission of the anthropologist's tape recorder, minus anthropologist, into their secret rites for the dead - is particularly fascinating. Gold also discusses the communal generative response to mortality that occurs in village women's celebration of fertility on Calf Twelfth. Occasionally, however, Gold's reading of the language of the transcribed texts she considers seems strained, particularly where it is favoured over interpretations that might have been drawn from ethnographic material. For example, consideration of the monthly household propitiation of identified and installed spirits of dead kin might 'fruitfully' have contributed to Gold's discussion of women's songs to 'ancestors' and 'heroes' in explaining these categories of the deceased.

Gold presents a threefold typology of pilgrimage formulated according to its stated aims: for aid in solving worldly matters, generically described as 'sorrow-and-trouble'; for 'sinking flowers', that is, disposing of the bones of the deceased; and for 'wandering'. Accordingly, the following three chapters successively describe pilgrimages to the shrines of local deities, journeys to Haridvar to immerse the bones of deceased relatives in the Ganges, and long-distance tours to pan-Indian pilgrimage centres. To an ethnographer of the region, Gold's transactional analysis of pilgrims' encounters with deities at shrines is the least convincing of these, and it is slightly at odds with the rest of the book. Her account is based on observation of a single shrine within her fieldwork village, and focuses rather conventionally on infertility and madness to typify the kind of divine aid sought in such contexts, while scarcely hinting at the roles of the shrine officiants and attendants she describes in local political alliances. To study other types of pilgrimage, Gold accompanied pilgrims on their round trips to Haridvar

and other pilgrimage sites, and the chapters dealing with these are consequently more comprehensive and assured. The use of the term *phul* ('flowers') to refer to the bones of the deceased, and its resonances as a metaphor also for reproduction and the fruits of life (children are also called 'flowers'), are considered at length, and provide both the title and an underlying theme of the book. Both the trip to Haridvar and the *darshan* bus tour are vividly described from the author's viewpoint as she travels with pilgrims from her fieldwork area, and the pleasures and discomforts of journeys 'to wander' are brought out clearly.

Certain difficulties present themselves with the typology of pilgrimage that is used to structure this work, despite the best efforts of the author. Presumably as a result of the need to distinguish analytically journeys 'for wandering' from journeys 'to sink flowers', the same pilgrimages are rather confusingly represented in different chapters; but the possible implications, for Gold's typology, of pilgrimages undertaken for more than one purpose go unremarked. Ethnographers of village India may also be dissatisfied in finding little consideration of caste or economic status, features which substantially affect both the form and the prominence of various rituals associated with the dead, and the types of pilgrimage undertaken by different groups. In a study which considers pilgrimage from the perspective of householders in their village context, these omissions are disappointing.

It is perhaps inevitable that in studies which attempt to characterize aspects of popular religious traditions through an analytic framework that is strongly informed by the study of classical texts, such problems should arise. However, Gold's obvious sympathy with the character of Rajasthani village Hinduism, her awareness of the inevitably partial realities produced by her own account, and her reading of local oral traditions easily compensate for these problems. With its beautiful and sensitive translations of vernacular religious texts and Rajasthani songs, *Fruitful Journeys* constitutes an important contribution to Indian studies.

HELEN LAMBERT

CHARLES CAPWELL, *The Music of the Bauls of Bengal*, Kent: Kent State University Press 1986. x, 242 pp. References, Index, Maps, Plates, Tables. £32.50.

In this useful and well-produced book an American musicologist describes, on the basis of two-and-a-half years' field study, the musical culture of the Bauls, the best known of what have been termed India's 'obscure religious cults'. Since the late nineteenth century this Bengal sect has received increasing attention and patronage from both Bengali and foreign intellectuals and littérateurs, but the Bauls remain 'obscure' in the origins of their beliefs and practices and also in their



precise current doctrines. The Bauls are, typically, devotional musicians; they are unified and defined as much by their musical life as by their religion. A thorough analysis of their music is justifiable in its own right and also as a supplement to what is already available, in Bengali or in European languages, on Baul history, philosophy and 'literature' - i.e., the texts of their superb songs. Capwell's study will stand on its musicological, rather than its sociological, merits, and his text is well illustrated with translations of songs, musical examples, and excellent photographs. An appendix contains a good sample of further song-texts with translations which convey much of the power and verbal sophistication of the originals. A taped recording of many songs, including the examples in the book, is available from the publisher, though unfortunately this was not submitted for review. Several other Baul performances are elsewhere available in commercially produced recordings.

The most enlightening part of Capwell's non-musical material comes in a series of personal 'backgrounds' of singers. While not in any sense sociologically rigorous, these contain a good deal of genealogical and miscellaneous information, told in an informal anecdotal style. They do in fact assist the reader to piece together an understanding of the conditions of musical performance. Capwell's fifth chapter, 'Performance Contexts', deals with some of the occasions and physical conditions in which one may expect to hear *Baul-gan* (song), but his observations on the Baul's attitudes and purposes in performance are more scattered. 'There are no proscriptions or prescriptions', he tells us (p. 60), 'about where or when singing is permissible for a Baul; circumscribing the activity would be a contradiction of the very spontaneity he symbolizes.' But remarks on pages 11, 12, 29, 34, 36 and 42 suggest a variety of more specific attitudes, with an underlying ambiguity, towards singing for gain and for public amusement or edification or celebration. Ethnomusicologists will be interested in Capwell's classification of *Baul-gan* as 'professional folk music' (p. 42), a term derived from David Johnson's 1972 study of eighteenth-century Scotland, but if they read carefully the discussion that leads him to this term they may wish to clarify or qualify it; singing is not the exclusive profession of all Bauls, and their music is sometimes more fundamentally votive than 'professional' in the conventional sense.

Capwell historically links the songs, which are characteristically performed to the accompaniment of a small instrumental ensemble, with the early Bengali *caryapadas*, a repertoire of devotional songs composed perhaps as early as the tenth century. The link he perceives is both textual and musical. It is impossible to say much about the melodic character of the *caryapadas* but the structural similarities are striking, though this may also be said of song-poems in other regional traditions. Some of these traditions tend to specify ragas for individual songs; the *caryapada* manuscripts carry such prescriptions, and for this reason are seen by Capwell as being much more closely related to the 'art-music' practice of their time (p. 33). Baul songs, he states, do not 'follow the prescriptions for any particular raga', though 'it is reasonable to point out similarities between

melodic phrases and scales of *Baul-gan* and those of some ragas'. In my view, Capwell, and Sukumar Ray whom he quotes at length on this point (p. 144f.), in an understandable attempt to distinguish genres of music, apply a rather too aristocratic definition of raga. If this term is taken in the sense of the 'classical' (*sastriya*) melodic shape, with all its technical rules and circumscriptions, then certainly *Baul-gan* is not 'in raga', being freer and more flexible in this particular sense. But no Indian musicologist could fail to recognize the melodic similarity - I would say even 'kinship' - that numerous passages show with other South Asian songs. What distinguishes a particular song or group of songs within a repertoire is in part a predilection for certain melodic types. The same may be said, in a wider context, of a regional musical tradition within the melodic repertoires of the South Asian field. If we dismiss the notion of raga from a 'folk' tradition we have to find some other way of identifying and classifying the striking homogeneities of much of South Asian regional music. It is certainly helpful to distinguish raga, as a basic modal/melodic framework, from the detailed refinement and definition of melodic movement and sequence as found in the 'canonical' styles in India; but the connection of the two - 'classical' ragas often being in fact formalizations of regional melodic structures - is yet to be disproved. Capwell tells us that Baul songs are close to other folk traditions of the Bengal region. He does not show examples of these similarities, but it is easy to believe that there is, within a geographical region, an identifiable preference for certain melodic 'idioms' within a wider North Indian 'language'. Perhaps the styles of embellishment also show such affinities.

As for the structure of the songs, as far as we can tell from texts alone links may be seen not only with the *caryapadas*, which Capwell illustrates, but also with many other compositional types of *prabandhas* which are found in current musicological treatises from various regions. The striking common features are the strophic division, the repeated refrain (often termed *dhruva*), the distinction of two pitch registers in certain sections, and the frequent, though not ubiquitous, *bhanita* (author's or singer's signature) in the final strophe. Capwell is, I believe, quite correct in asserting that the commonness of this structure shows *Baul-gan* to be 'part of an Indian musical lingua franca with a venerable past' (p. 176). To be a little more specific, I would add that in the musicological treatises in the sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Vaisnava tradition of Eastern India forms of song are described and exemplified which resemble the *Baul-gan* in even closer detail, namely the equation of first strophe and refrain, the refrain of anomalous length (p. 87), the change of *tala* (metrical structure), the line-filling syllables *a*, *re* etc., and the curious move at certain points from metered song to 'parlando', called in the Sanskrit works an *alapa*. Certainly, some of these features link the *Baul-gan* with the more literary Bengali *padavali-kirtan*, as Capwell indicates, but a (perhaps older) connection may also be seen with the *prabandhas*, especially the peculiar *suda* described and exemplified in the earlier texts. Within the lingua franca we seem to be dealing with an Eastern 'dialect'. Capwell shows (pp.

167ff.) how the melodic structure within the strophe of *Baul-gan* is typically ternary rather than the binary it had been considered hitherto.

Capwell's explanation of the Bauls' tonal system is based on his own model, deduced from his hearing of the songs; he stresses that the Bauls have 'no body of consciously formulated musical theory' (p. 123). He classifies the tonality of this music according to the nature of the third degree of the scale, whether 'natural' or 'flat', in a generally tempered (chromatic) range of pitches. Interesting, however, is his additional identification of a 'neutral' third (pp. 141f.), though on the basis of only a single, possibly eccentric, performance in which it figured prominently. Could this difference from the 'harmonium' scale be in fact a remnant from an older natural and untempered scale, or perhaps an influence from some other tradition? Otherwise, the tonal system seems to differ from modern Hindustani scale in nomenclature more than in substance, though certain pitch *sequences* are rare, and some altogether absent. For Capwell there is, both in the Hindustani and in the Baul scales, a flattened fifth degree. Hindustani theory considers the fifth an immovable (*acala*) pitch; that which Capwell considers to be flattened fifth is seen by Hindustani musicians as a raised fourth (*tivra madhyam*). The point is debatable. In some contexts the note may appear to function more as a fifth than as a fourth, as is argued for example by Jairazbhoy in *The Ragas of North Indian Music*. An opposite view would be that, particularly in the absence of a modulatory harmonic system, a pitch is precisely what it is called, and how it is perceived, by consensus. In Hindustani music this would argue sometimes for the 'chromatic' juxtaposition of natural sharp fourth. In the Baul case the consensus is unknowable because we have to accept from Capwell that the Bauls do not label their pitches. But he should so much the more clearly argue his case for opting in some phrases for the 'enharmonic' alternatives, F flat to E natural and G flat to F sharp (to take C as merely notional tonic). He tells us that the F flat and G flat are used only in ornamentation. This is confirmed by their absence in his transcriptions, which presumably therefore take, at most, only partial account of melodic embellishment. Capwell could make further valuable contributions, in his future publications on Baul music, by telling us more about the Baul style of ornamentation and also more about the more technical aspects of their musical perceptions. I find it improbable that, even if the Bauls have no formal theory of music, they do not have some quasi-technical method of talking about certain musical structures.

I have raised some queries that interest me in Capwell's stimulating and readable study. These are not intended to diminish the contribution he has made; no student of Indian musicology, especially of folk music, should proceed without reading this book.

JONATHAN KATZ

GAIL KLIGMAN, *The Wedding of the Dead: Ritual, Poetics and Popular Culture in Transylvania* [Studies on the History of Society and Culture; ser. eds. Victoria E. Bonnell and Lynn Hunt], Berkeley etc.: University of California Press 1988. xiii, 410 pp. References, Index, Glossary, Map, Illustrations. \$45.00.

Gail Kligman explains that she was not drawn to northern Romania because of Bram Stoker's novel: 'our Dracula is a Gothic man, son of an English imagination. Their Dracula was a fifteenth-century prince.' Having driven a stake deep into the heart of popular Western images of Transylvania, the author is left free to provide an enthralling account, which has its own magic, of a contemporary East European society. *The Wedding of the Dead* is a study of life-cycle rituals in a village in the Maramureş region close to the Romanian-Soviet border. The author argues that festivals of rural Transylvania form a coherent system through which life and death are made comprehensible. She describes, with admirable clarity, the organization and social relations of the villagers, paying particular attention to gender relations.

As can be deduced from its title, much of the book is concerned with marriage. This institution is so highly regarded that vulgar symbols may be left outside the homes of men and women who remain unmarried for too long. Death before marriage is considered to be such a tragedy that rituals are held to ensure that the deceased will be wed in the next world. Although marriage is esteemed, a woman loses a great deal through it since she has to accept a subordinate position in relation to her husband and mother-in-law. On arrival of her first child, providing it is a boy, a woman's status improves. The birth of a girl, however, is greeted with great disappointment.

The book is rich in ethnographic detail and peppered with examples of oral poetry accompanied by excellent translations. Given that the monograph deals with relations between the ordinary citizen and the state, it is a wonder that the book was ever written. Although conditions for scholars were more favourable in the 1970s, when Kligman's initial research was undertaken, fieldwork so close to bitterly disputed international frontiers could never have been easy. Recent events in Romania, namely the (now overthrown) government's attempts to reduce the number of rural villages, have thrown the contents of this book into sharp focus. *The Wedding of the Dead* should not only be of interest to social scientists and regional specialists, but ought to be read by members of the media covering the current crisis in Eastern Europe. This is one of those rare volumes that actually lives up to the publisher's blurb and this reviewer will be very surprised if it does not win awards in several disciplines.

MICHAEL HITCHCOCK

JOHA LOUW-POTGIETER, *Afrikaner Dissidents: A Social Psychological Study of Identity and Dissent* [Multilingual Matters no. 39; ser. ed. Derrick Sharp], Clevedon and Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters 1988. ix, 131 pp., Appendixes, References, Index. £8.95.

This is a study of South African Afrikaner identity from a social psychological perspective, within the framework of social identity theory. Louw-Potgieter asked a number of dissenters to provide her with their written autobiographies and twenty-four responded, among them one woman. The present book is an analysis of their responses.

The term 'dissenter' in South Africa is applied to white, left-wing Afrikaans-speakers. It is not applied to English-speakers. Afrikaners see their nationalism as the country's mainstream philosophy, and fellow-Afrikaners who differ from it are placed outside the *volk*, even being categorized as traitors. Dissenters are subjected to political, religious, social, educational and economic sanctions. The origins of Afrikaner nationalism can be traced to the latter half of the nineteenth century, but it was only in the twentieth century that Afrikaner nationalism effectively mobilized itself, formulated collective goals and introduced a unity of purpose into corporate Afrikaner action.

English-speakers suffer no such sanctions if they dissent politically from what at any given moment might happen to be mainstream English-speaking political thought. As in the United Kingdom, they simply go their different political ways. The term 'dissenter' describes Afrikaners who dissent to the left of the ruling National Party - those who dissent to the right regard themselves as the rightful inheritors of the legacy of Afrikaner nationalism.

During the past decade, however, many Afrikaners (particularly in the intellectual, business and professional classes) have become disillusioned with apartheid, and this has led to a weakening of that corporate identity that was the power-base of Afrikaner nationalism. In the process, dissent has been shown to be neither a static, sudden nor easy experience. The author uses the cognitive-motivational theory of social identity to discuss dissidence. She avoids the use of the individualistic approach and concentrates instead on the process by which an Afrikaner becomes a dissident. From a psychological perspective, the dissident is treated as a deviant. The motive for his deviance is usually that he begins to feel uncomfortable ideologically and socially. General themes are drawn from the autobiographies, dealing principally with the respondents' awareness of the processes of change in South Africa, and of the effects of this on their past, present and future formation of a new identity. Most feel misled and deceived by 'Afrikanerhood' and experience rejection, hurt, distrust and marginalization from the very community to which they are reacting.

The author emphasizes that the responses recorded here reflect those of a particular period, and that they change constantly as the situation in South Africa changes. The book concludes that there is no such thing as a monolithic Afrikaner

identity - ideological and psychological disunity is in fact one of the sources of change in South Africa.

INGRID UYS

TIM INGOLD, DAVID RICHES and JAMES WOODBURN, *Hunters and Gatherers 1: History, Evolution and Social Change* [Explorations in Anthropology; ser. eds. John Gledhill and Bruce Kapferer], Oxford etc.: Berg 1988. x, 285 pp., References, Index, Plates, Figures, Maps, Tables. £32.00.

TIM INGOLD, DAVID RICHES and JAMES WOODBURN, *Hunters and Gatherers 2: Property, Power and Ideology* [Explorations in Anthropology ser. eds. John Gledhill and Bruce Kapferer], Oxford etc.: Berg 1988. x, 291 pp., References, Index, Plates, Figures, Maps, Tables. £32.00.

These two volumes develop the approach to hunter-gatherer societies explored in Leacock and Lee's *Politics and History in Band Societies* of 1982 (the product of an earlier conference in the same series). In this approach, hunter-gatherer communities are not isolated survivals from an earlier stage in human social evolution, but have developed alongside and in interaction with, surrounding pastoralists, farmers and colonial powers. Despite a tendency by some to view hunter-gatherers as typifying 'what it is to be a human', the majority of contributors see the form of hunter-gatherer social life not as a natal condition, but as the product of specific circumstances. For anthropologists not directly concerned with hunter-gatherer studies, the principal interest of these volumes probably lies in their presentation of competing explanations for hunter-gatherer social behaviour, explanations which exemplify wider theoretical issues. Is social anthropology a science or a humanity? Should we produce a taxonomy of social types or emphasize the variability of behaviour within communities? Is ecology, external domination or internal politics the primary cause of social change?

Lewis-Williams asks: what did it mean to the Maluti San to be 'the people of the Eland'? Guenther analyzes animal symbolism in contemporary Bushman culture. His paper leaves unresolved the question: are animals conceived as paralleling or opposing human behaviour? Kratz looks at ways of elucidating Okiek (Dorobo) symbolism, while Morphy shows how the model of land tenure expressed in Yolngu paintings conceals the processes by which Aboriginal rights to land are transferred.

Marquardt insists that anthropology is 'not merely a natural science', and that to discover the contradictions inherent in the complex social hierarchy of the Calusi of Florida, the unique, contingent events of history must be examined. Hall adopts a rather similar position in reconstructing long-term change in southern

African communities. Ellen provides a detailed account of historical change among the Nuaulu of Indonesia to support analysis which is explicitly processual rather than typological.

Ingold, Woodburn, Gibson and Guemple, on the other hand, are unashamedly typological, looking for a general form of society which is diagnostic of hunter-gatherers. Ingold argues for a single foraging mode of production, maintaining that human foraging is distinguished by the actors' self-conscious behaviour. Woodburn welcomes discussion of his two types of hunter-gatherer society based on immediate and delayed return, but declines to see social organization as an 'epiphenomenon of technology, work and property rules'.

While some contributors accept Woodburn's dichotomy, others show that social interaction is more variable. Myers makes the point that the immediate return obtained by distributing material resources sets up (or reinforces) social relationships that are expected to yield a delayed return. Poderson and Waehle insist that to explain the flux of Mbuti social life, both ecological conditions and interaction with farming communities must be taken into account. Variability in these two factors allows explanatory hypotheses to be tested. Pálsson uses statistical analysis of variability between hunting-gathering and fishing communities to reach the conclusion that dependence on fishing is induced by political, not ecological conditions. Birch and Altman and Peterson look at the specific circumstances under which sharing occurs in particular Inuit and Australian Aboriginal communities. By demonstrating that a generalized ethic of sharing is not pervasive, they are able to ask why it is that actors share certain resources, or share in certain circumstances.

Smith rejects the historical indeterminacy he regards as characteristic of social anthropological research, and dismisses as tautological the Ingold/Woodburn argument that hunter-gatherers share because they have a generalized ethic of reciprocity. He proposes an evolutionary model to predict variability in the transaction of resources in hunter-gatherer societies, and argues that sharing will occur only when the individuals participating, not just the 'collectivity', stand to benefit.

The debate over whether the proper level of analysis should be collective organization or individual transactions suggests a kind of modern Zeno's paradox. Does a close-up focus on the minutiae of individual behaviour illuminate or obscure the general character of societies and cultures? My sympathy is with the former view. I would like to think that those who expect a detailed examination of interaction to be unproductive do so because, like those who failed to see how Achilles could overtake the tortoise, they have adopted an inappropriate theory.

ROBERT LAYTON

ROBERT LAYTON (ed.) *Who Needs the Past? Indigenous Values and Archaeology* [One World Archaeology 5; ser. ed. Peter J. Ucko], London etc.: Unwin Hyman 1989. xx, 206 pp., Index, Figures, Tables. £28.00.

One of the explicit aims of the World Archaeology Congress held in Southampton in 1986 was to develop a dialogue between academically oriented archaeologists and the peoples whose past heritage archaeologists study. The theme of *Who Needs the Past?*, which is a collection of papers presented at that Congress, is central to that issue. It deals with concepts of past time and attitudes to the past in different cultural environments.

The authors comprise both professionals in archaeology and cognate disciplines and members of Third- and Fourth-World communities whose past is the focus of archaeological research. This has led to a great variety of styles of presentation. The more analytically oriented studies of 'professionals' may have more immediate appeal to their academic colleagues. The shared conceptual language and the analytical aims conform to our expectations and interests in discussions of this nature.

In a concise and clear paper on southwest Highland Colombia, Joanne Rappaport shows how Western percepts of continuous and linear time can be replaced by a perception of the past encoded in episodic confluences of events whose referents are as much spatial as temporal, to construct a coherent and socially meaningful 'history'. She also argues that such a view of their past enables indigenous people of the region to mediate the potential stresses of their present territorial situation among themselves, and thus create a unifying basis for their relations with the dominant and alien political structure.

The importance of spatial referents in the formulation of 'histories' is directly relevant to the archaeologist's concept of site, though the temporal values given to site/locality can differ significantly between archaeological and indigenous systems. The role of locality is alluded to in a number of papers, but receives little further explicit discussion. A notable exception is Raharijaona who considers the importance of sites for the Betsileo of Madagascar, but notes the different emphasis that an archaeologist would give to some of these same sites.

Most papers concentrate either explicitly on the structuring of temporal concepts (for example, Williams and Mununggurr for east Arnhem Land, Chase for east coast Cape York Peninsula, Baines for Dynastic Egypt, Ndagala and Zengu for the Hadzabe), or on the validating role of the past in mediating stresses of the present (for example, Sparkes for Classical Greece, Nwana in northwest Cameroon, Pina-Cabral in Portugal). In this context, Margaret Clunies Ross's paper on the role of performance in the transmission of knowledge about the past is of especial interest. She illustrates how a system of controlled access to knowledge, and to its artistic expression, operates to maintain an ideology of timelessness and unchanging lore in the face of the vicissitudes of human experience.



While papers such as those by Rappaport and Clunies Ross provide insights into non-Western views about the past, these are filtered in their presentation by 'academic' interpreters - albeit of a high quality. A more direct impact may be sought from the papers by indigenous authors. These range widely in their perspectives, from the thoughtful and very personal presentation of Inuit concerns by Jack Anawak to the frankly political approach, in Western terms, of Antonio Males for the Otavales Indians of the Andes.

At the academic level, Narain Prasad's attempt to find a close congruence between archaeologically-derived chronologies and the historical framework of classical Hindu texts is not convincing, not least because it glosses selectively across archaeological developments in disparate regions. However, both this paper and the similar concern with Hindu literary historical tradition of Deena Bandhu Pandey exemplify the cultural importance that traditional sources about the past carry for upholding the values of present-day conceptual systems. That these authors apparently felt the need to seek a rather literal conciliation between the traditional Hindu view and that of a Western academic discipline, illustrates the unease that the presumed cultural superiority of Western science often elicits in non-Western contexts. Patrick Mbunwe-Samba's appeal seriously to integrate indigenous traditions into archaeological perspectives of the past, while rather general and unsystematic in its presentation, reveals a more assertive attitude to the integrity of indigenous values. If these essays appear unsatisfactory from an academic perspective, this surely highlights the enormous effort that is still required to bridge the gap and comprehend how alternative systems of 'history' have their legitimate contextual validity. This is not a plea for cultural relativism but for cross-cultural communication; indigenous historical consciousness is a vital element in the aspirations of indigenous peoples to establish control of their political and cultural destinies. As such, they need to interact with the dominant political systems rooted in Western attitudes.

A salutary reminder of the archaeologist's sometime élitist perceptions - even of our own past - is provided by the two papers by Kathy Emmott and Peter Stone which examine popular concepts of the past in English society. These appear almost as remote from the professional's interests in the discipline as are other indigenous views. In the words of Peter Stone: 'the complacent attitude of archaeologists and their apparent disregard of the opinions of the rest of the population is a near-suicidal stance' (p. 203). Some of the papers presented in this volume suggest that this complacency has begun to crack, but our vision through these cracks is still very blurred. *Who Needs the Past?* is a volume which illustrates the problems in cross-cultural communication about the past, and about past heritage, more than it resolves them. The variety of organizational systems for the past that emerge from these papers is examined in Layton's introduction, itself a substantial contribution and a valuable discussion of the significance of the papers in the context of anthropological and archaeological thought.

ANDRÉE ROSENFELD

J. LEITCH WRIGHT, JR. *Creeks and Seminoles: Destruction and Regeneration of the Muscogulge People*, Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press 1986. xv, 383pp., Maps, Illustrations, Bibliography, Index. £33.25.

The Creeks and Seminoles bear ethnic labels of white American invention and comprise peoples forced together by the events of historical contact with white society. They represent an amalgamation and reduction of from fifty to one hundred distinct tribal or linguistic identities in what are now the states of Georgia, Alabama and Florida. In time they came to include persons of Indian and white parentage, as well as white and African, Indian and African, and tri-racial (Indian, African and white) descent. They were raided and plundered in 1539 and 1540 by Hernando de Soto, and later became embroiled in the various European wars affecting this region from the eighteenth century onwards. They repeatedly felt white pressures for land. They were subjected to the Creek War of 1813-15, which had complex roots in American politics, nativist movements and the War of 1812. The three Seminole Wars through the first half of the nineteenth century led to further losses of life and land and large-scale migration to Oklahoma. Remnants remained in the east, however, including the rather well-known Seminoles of the Florida Everglades. Wright concentrates largely on the nineteenth century, and offers detailed history of how diverse peoples survived destruction and dislocation to become a new people to whom he has given the imprecise name of expediency, Muscogulge. Many of the peoples whom he includes did not speak languages of the Muskogean family, and the reader may wonder whether twentieth-century experiences may not have reduced whatever historical unity the nineteenth century brought about. Muscogulge at best is a scholar's artifice for referring broadly to a collectivity of peoples who, for a time at least, partially shared a common plight and whose individual ethnic identities are often impossible to trace through the historical record.

R. H. BARNES

PAMELA A. BUNTE and ROBERT J. FRANKLIN, *From the Sands to the Mountain: Change and Persistence in a Southern Paiute Community* [Studies in the Anthropology of North American Indians], Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press 1987. xv, 339pp., Tables, Maps, Figures, Appendixes, References, Index. £19.50.

A Ph.D. thesis and a report commissioned by the Southern Paiute Tribe have been merged by the authors to produce this history of the San Juan Paiute community of northern Arizona and southern Utah. Their land is incorporated into the vast Navajo reservation, and, according to the authors, they have suffered nearly as

much from encroachment by the Navajo as from the whites. The report was written in support of an effort to secure recognition of separate tribal status for the San Juan Paiute from the Bureau of Indian Affairs. The Navajo accordingly come in for a good deal of partisan criticism. It would be hard to say that much real excitement comes through in this contribution to the 'climate of federal neglect' genre of ethnohistory. Instead, it supplies generally useful information in much the same pattern that similar background studies have done in recent decades for tribal litigation against the federal government. History is divided into very large chunks (essentially pre- and post-1900), and anthropological filler provided. Modern change and persistence are outlined.

R. H. BARNES

DOUGLAS L. OLIVER, *Native Cultures of the Pacific Islands*, Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press 1989. ix, 154 pp., Bibliography, Index, Figures. No price given.

DOUGLAS L. OLIVER, *Oceania: The Native Cultures of Australia and the Pacific Islands*, Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press 1989. xii, 1183 pp. (2 vols.), Figures, Maps. No price given.

These latest works of Douglas Oliver have been written, according to the author, 'partly in response to suggestions that I update my superannuated *The Pacific Islands*, and partly in response to all the nonsense being disseminated about an alleged "the Pacific way"' (*Oceania 1*, p. ix). He wishes for the work to be 'more than a mere work of reference', and declares his firm allegiance to the tradition of scholars who 'are able to separate their interpretations from their descriptions' (*ibid.*).

His formidable work aims at covering the precolonial history of the Oceanic region. Its starting-point is approximately 50,000 years ago, with the pioneer migration from Asia into the Oceanic region. Oliver's scientific and descriptive concern is with what he calls 'the cultural culminations of the interplay' among the many variables shaping Oceania's 'hundreds of distinct indigenous cultures, as they were just before they began to undergo radical Western-induced changes' (*ibid.*:xi).

Throughout the work, stress is put on the diversity, at all levels, of customs, tools, 'gene-pools' etc. The books are crowded with passages such as: 'readers, by now accustomed to expecting cultural differences among Island Societies, will not be surprised to learn' (*Native Cultures*, p. 60). The works contain an enormous amount of often very detailed descriptions, the range of subjects covering most aspect of Oceanic cultures. Oliver keeps a consistently clear style,

and one cannot but be impressed by the sheer volume of the work. Moreover, Oliver makes painstakingly sure that the basis of his argument is clear to his readers.

To cope with the problem of presentation, the author has chosen a subject division which might seem odd to a reader who knows that this work is from 1989. To separate, for instance, 'Sex and Reproduction' or 'Warfare and Killing', both classified under the main heading of 'Activities', from 'Social Relations', obviously causes the author some misgivings as well; but adhering to his 'scientific' outlook where 'data' should be separated from 'interpretation' as far as possible, such misgivings have apparently not seemed weighty enough to bring reconsideration. When leafing through Volume One of *Oceania* and finding plates representing different physical types (under the heading 'Population and Physical Types'), the feeling that one is reading a book written within the paradigm of another era is only strengthened, and it makes one wonder for what readership these volumes are intended.

The main headings of Volume One are 'Background', subsuming such varied topics as 'Population and Physical Types', 'Languages' and 'Ethnology', and 'Activities', ranging from 'Definitions, Religious Ideas, and Tools' to 'Infancy to Death - And Beyond'. The main heading of Volume Two is 'Social Relations', and in this part the subject division is by area. The abridged version, *Native Cultures*, comprising 150 pages, is divided into four chapters: 'Physical Setting', 'Prehistory', 'Activities', and 'Social Relations'. The condensed form of this volume brings the comparative approach adopted throughout the whole work more to the fore. In *Oceania*, the fruits of comparison are too often lost, at least from this reader. I shall adduce one example of the style which causes this effect, particularly noticeable when one has plunged through more than a thousand pages: 'Nauru, another raised coral island, is about 170 miles west of Banaba and even more isolated than the latter; and while the Austronesian language spoken by its 1500 or so people (in precolonial times) has not been more specifically classified, their social organization resembled closely that of the Marshallese in some respects and of the central and eastern Caroline Islanders in others' (*Oceania*, 2, p. 100). His summaries at the end of each longer passage, and the general amount of repetition, helps to a certain extent to counteract this affect.

Let me draw attention to the main points of what I find problematic in this work. The first concerns the difficulties connected with the use of 'contact' sources when describing 'precontact' societies. This is a problem which Oliver himself recognizes, and I shall only point to the great care which needs to be taken when relying largely upon secondary sources. There is an inherent methodological difficulty connected with basing large-scale comparative generalizations upon what Oliver admits to be 'my own unsystematic sampling of ethnographies' (*Oceania* 1, p. 252). For example, when, in his account of Samoa, he examines indigenous systems of governance and the role of women in it (*Oceania* 2, p. 949), Oliver makes no mention whatsoever of such central female political figures as the war-goddess Nafanua or the 'Queen' (*tupu* or *tafa'ifa*) Salamasina.

Another difficulty concerns the 'scientific' approach adopted in this work, and linked to it is the question of which audience *Oceania* is intended for. Because the work is so detailed, providing information on just about everything from preferences in sexual positions to the frequency of ambilineality in Oceanic societies, it is, in spite of the author's hopes to the contrary, quite natural to use the books for reference purposes. If one decides to enter into the theoretical discussion, largely avoided by the author, of whether there really is such a thing as data uncontaminated by interpretation, and if for the sake of experiment one decides to consider the 'data' compiled in this work from an interpretative angle, one might perhaps be led to understand such a concept as 'the Pacific way' as referring to the 'cultural flavour' or, to use a Geertzian word, to the 'ethos' of the Pacific world. Before dismissing the concept too quickly as 'containing more rhetoric than reality' (*Native Cultures*, p. ix), perhaps our interpretative perspective should cause us to take into consideration the fact that Pacific cultures are known for their cultural elaborations of rhetorics?

INGJERD HOËM

BOB KRAUSS, *Keneti: South Seas Adventures of Kenneth Emory*, Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press 1988. ix, 398pp., Chronology, Index, Illustrations, Maps. No price given.

Some guys have all the luck. Brought up in Hawaii in the 1900s, 'Keneti' sails with Jack London as an adolescent, goes to an Ivy League college, before graduating is hired as an ethnologist (without knowing what the term means), spends the next five decades of his life touring the islands, and along the way marries a beautiful Tahitian and slowly wins a reputation as the greatest Pacific ethnologist-cum-archaeologist of his times. By the end of the book Keneti still lives: though now in his late eighties he is wheeled into special conferences held in his honour - he doesn't speak to the assembled, he toots his whistle.

It's a great story and there are several ways of telling it. One narrative is the record of his intellectual achievement: his sustained investigation into the prehistory of Pacific migrations; how he built up a coherent account of these movements, plus the techniques he developed (and sometimes invented); his long-standing argument with Stimson over the supposed existence of a supreme God in Polynesia. Another plot, is the history of academic institutions in the Pacific: combating ignorance and prejudice; cajoling funds out of local patrons; coping with petty rivalries; organizing and co-ordinating anthropological endeavour in a virgin territory. A third storyline is that of one man's obsessive dream of the Pacific: how he chose ethnology in order to remain in the islands, and then spent half a century chasing his mirage over the largest sea in the world. A fourth

narrative is the more personal: a sensitive account of Keneti's desires, loves, friends, hates, disappointments, and moments of greatest anguish.

It is a great pity that Krauss can't make up his mind how to tell it. A journalist and long-standing friend of Keneti, he feels unable to criticize his old buddy, does not fully understand how academic politics works nor the stakes its practitioners play for. The man Krauss knows is a South Sea adventurer for the twentieth century, an untiring traveller with an intellectual justification, a man of great enthusiasms and stirring conversation. What Krauss likes to describe are the exciting moments and the displays of humanity by the locals during Keneti's latest trip. His accounts of these expeditions, though, usually open with purple passages and read like undigested *précis* of his subject's diaries. In contrast, he gives only the bare bones of Keneti's intimate life. As soon as a bit of sexual nitty-gritty or telling detail about marital strife is needed, the biographer quickly returns to the museum and what interests Keneti is currently pursuing there. Several times while reading this book, I had to guess what was actually going on between Keneti and his wife/friends/colleagues/enemies. Having to read between the lines becomes tiresome when pushing oneself to finish what is already an overlong text.

The key narrative underlying this biography is an allegory of salvage against all types of adversity - meteorological, biological, psychological, bureaucratic, financial. As the blurb ingenuously reveals: 'the most important moments of his adventurous life were spent in tropical islands and arid atolls so remote most people still don't know how to reach them. He found lost Polynesian temples, collected the last scraps of ancient Polynesian mythology...' The ethnologist as hero, Keneti is portrayed as innocent academic battling against the odds, gaining the prize before it is lost forever. He is a man of action, not a contemplative. (As a doctoral student at Yale, he found his teacher Malinowski 'too theoretical'.) If some of his work already seemed out of date by the 1950s, that doesn't matter, for his enthusiasm and industriousness will save the day and burnish others' memories of him.

Krauss' polyglot text mixes (shaken, not stirred) journalese with academic vernacular. This linguistic confusion reflects his uncertainty about what he is trying to do. It is lucky for him that so much of Keneti's march through life is so appealing to any educated person capable of looking beyond the end of his nose. It is also clear that Kenneth Emory deserves a good biography. Perhaps one will be written.

JEREMY MACCLANCY

MARK S. FLEISHER, *Warehousing Violence* [Frontiers of Anthropology, Vol. 3; ser. ed. H. Russell Bernard], Newbury Park: Sage Publications 1989. 240 pp. £35.00 / £14.50.

This is a 'participant observation' study with a vengeance. The author, an anthropology professor, did his fieldwork the hard way by becoming a full-fledged 'staffer' for a year in a maximum security prison in California. He has constructed an insider's account of the institution's strategies for controlling a population of hardened convicts, for whom, he argues, violence is a central plank of their social hierarchy, individual identity and self-respect. Fleisher provides a vivid picture of life within the prison and the survival mechanisms of inmates and staff. He uses long quotations, detailed accounts of incidents, and personal recollections of his own fears, mistakes and successes, to show how a society of guards and captives manages to function with only occasional outbreaks of the serious violence which is constantly threatening. One of the best passages of the book describes his own first few days and his rite of passage from an outsider to a genuine prison 'hack'.

Despite his close understanding of institutional life, the main limitation of the book stems from the fact that Fleisher's sympathy and empathy lie almost entirely with the staff and management, while his portraits of the inmates remain curiously one-dimensional. He freely admits that he came very close to 'going native' as a prison guard, and his view of prisoners reflects typical prison officers' images. They are seen almost to a man as unreclaimable criminals, virtually a different species which should preferably never be let out into society. The only motivating factors he ascribes to them are short-term desires to obtain sexual gratification, extra perks like illegal brews, and power over other prisoners. Similarly, most of the criminologists he quotes are advocates of 'incapacitation' for major felons - that is, very long preventative sentences to keep them apart from the public - and of 'humane confinement' rather than 'rehabilitation' as the central goal of the prison system. The task of the authorities, he argues, is to construct an environment in which violence can be kept to a minimum and the costs of incarceration minimized through efficient prison industries: the 'factory with a fence'.

Despite the ostensible liberal régime, anything conceded to prisoners - turning a blind eye to minor 'scams', listening to grievances rather than using force, allowing them a degree of dignity, providing better facilities, and so on - is instrumental to the goal of running an efficient 'business' in which as few people as possible either rebel or get hurt. Just below the surface there lurks continually the very real threat of the use of repressive force. Any prisoner who bucks the system soon experiences the stick rather than the carrot, as everything turns 'penitentiary cold'. Weapons like loss of parole, leg-irons, solitary confinement, transfer to a tougher prison, and swingeing increases in sentence length, are ultimately what maintain order. And there is nothing the staff like better than the occasional violent struggle to subdue a prisoner and prove themselves as 'real' guards. Unfortunately, the image which comes across is of wild animals in an

efficiently managed zoo: their ferocity is a given fact, and there is little purpose in trying to understand it, to address its depths, or to communicate with the inmates as full members of the human race.

The theoretical implications of the study are not drawn out in any great depth - it is essentially a monograph - but there are many resonances for criminologists and anthropologists alike. This is a Goffmanesque 'total institution' *par excellence*, with 75 per cent of the inmates serving more than ten years, and there are rich data on the negotiation of roles and identities. The multiple layers of the forms of social control in operation are also well described, ranging from formal rules and discipline to organizational culture and informal reward structures. For criminologists, the book offers a rare account of the fashionable notion of humane containment in practice, with the prison seen as a warehouse rather than as a tool for changing those undergoing sentence.

One is left with conflicting reactions and emotions. On the one hand, there is no doubt that violence is contained much more effectively than under traditional régimes, and perhaps that is realistically all one can ask of the last resort of the penal system. On the other, this seems a bleak, soulless, essentially hopeless world, and one is left wondering whether there is not some other way of limiting violence without writing people off as beyond understanding and with no future. Overall, it is a powerful book which sticks in the memory, and while having no great pretensions beyond descriptive study it is highly thought-provoking.

MIKE MAGUIRE



## PUBLICATIONS RECEIVED

AGAR, Michael H., *Independents Declared: The Dilemmas of Independent Trucking* [Smithsonian Series in Ethnographic Inquiry; ser. eds. Ivan Karp and William L. Merrill], Washington and London: Smithsonian Institution Press, no date. 185 pp., References, Index. \$27.50.

ALLEN, Catherine J., *The Hold Life Has: Coca and Cultural Identity in an Andean Community* [Smithsonian Series in Ethnographic Inquiry; ser. eds. Ivan Karp and William L. Merrill], Washington and London: Smithsonian Institution Press 1988. 252 pp., Appendixes, Glossary, Bibliography, Index. \$29.95.

BOISSEVAIN, Jeremy, and Jojoda VERRIPS (eds.), *Dutch Dilemmas: Anthropologists Look at the Netherlands*, Assen / Maastricht: Van Gorcum 1989. 181 pp., Maps, Tables, Figures. DF 139.50.

BRICKER, Victoria, R., and Gary H. GOSSEN (eds.), *Ethnographic Encounters in Southern Meso-America: Essays in Honour of Evon Zartman Vogt, Jr.* [Studies on Culture and Society vol. 3; eds. Richard M. Leventhal and J. Jorge Klor de Alva], Albany: Institute for Mesoamerican Studies, The University at Albany, State University of New York 1989. ix, 319 pp., Cumulative Bibliography of Evon Hartman Zogt, Jr., References Cited, Plates, Figures, Tables. \$25.00.

COLLINS, Robert O., *The Waters of the Nile: Hydropolitics and the Jonglei Canal 1900-1988* [Oxford Studies in African Affairs; gen. eds. John D. Hargreaves, Michael Twaddle, Terence Ranger], Oxford: Clarendon Press 1990. xviii, 413 pp., Select Bibliography, Index, Maps, Figures, Plates. £45.00.

CONNERTON, Paul, *How Societies Remember* [Themes in the Social Sciences], Cambridge etc.: Cambridge University Press 1989. vi, 115 pp., Indexes. £25.00/\$39.50/£8.50/\$11.95.

COWLING, Mary, *The Artist as Anthropologist: The Representation of Type and Character in Victorian Art*, Cambridge etc.: Cambridge University Press 1989. xvii, 370 pp., Bibliography, Index, Illustrations. £50.00/\$69.50.

*Critique of Anthropology*, Vol. IX, no. 2 (Autumn 1989).

EBER, Dorothy Harley, *When the Whalers Were up North: Inuit Memories from the Eastern Arctic* [McGill-Queen's Native and Northern Series, 1; ed. Bruce G. Trigger], Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press 1989. xvii, 180 pp., Bibliography, Index, Plates. £26.95.

ENGE, Kjell Z, and Scott WHITEFORD, *The Keepers of Water and Earth: Mexican Rural Social Organization and Irrigation*, Austin: University of Texas Press 1989. xiii, 199 pp., Bibliography, Index, Figures, Tables, Map, Illustrations. \$30.00.

FLEISHER, Mark S., *Warehousing Violence* [Frontiers of Anthropology, vol. 3; ser. ed. H. Russell Bernard], Newbury Park: Sage Publications 1989. 240 pp. £14.50.

GAMBLE, Clive, and Olga SOFFER, *The World at 18000 BP, Volume Two: Low Latitudes* [One World Archaeology], London etc.: Unwin Hyman 1990. xix, 334 pp., Indexes, Maps, Tables, Figures. £45.00.

GRIFFITH, Jeremy, *Reconciliation* (with a Foreword by Tim Macartney-Snape), Sydney: The Centre for Humanity's Adulthood 1989. 50 pp., Charts, Illustrations. No price given.

JOSSERAND, J. Kathryn, and Karen DAKIN, *Smoke and Mist: Mesoamerican Studies in Memory of Thelma D. Sullivan* (2 vols.) [BAR International Series 402(i) and 402(ii)], Oxford: BAR 1988. ix, 763 pp., Figures, Plates. £45.00.

*Journal for the Anthropological Study of Human Movement*, Vol. V, no. 4 (1989).

McLAUGHLIN, James, *My Friend the Indian* (Introduction by Robert M. Utley), Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press 1989. xvii, 434 pp., Index, Illustrations. £10.95.

MERRILL, William L., *Rarámuri Souls: Knowledge and Social Process in Northern Mexico* [Smithsonian Series in Ethnographic Inquiry; ser. eds. Ivan Karp and William L. Merrill], Washington and London: Smithsonian Institution Press 1988. xi, 210 pp., References, Index. \$24.95.

- MOYER, David, and Henri J.M. CLAESSEN, *Time Past, Time Present, Time Future: Essays in Honour of P.E. Josselin de Jong* [Verhandelingen van het Koninklijk Instituut voor Taal- Land- en Volkenkunde 131], Dordrecht: Foris Publications 1988. viii, 288 pp., Index, Figures, Maps. No price given.
- MURIE, James R., *Ceremonies of the Pawnee* (eds. Douglas R. Parks and Raymond D. Demallie) [Studies in the Anthropology of North American Indians], Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press 1989. xiv, 459 pp., Notes, Appendixes, Bibliography, Indexes, Figures, Illustrations. £41.40/£17.95.
- MYERS, Fred R., *Pintupi Country, Pintupi Self: Sentiment, Place and Politics among Western Desert Aborigines*, Washington and London: Smithsonian Institution Press / Canberra: Australian Institute of Aboriginal Studies 1986. 308 pp., References Cited, Index, Maps, Diagrams, Plates. No price given.
- NARAYAN, Kirin, *Storytellers, Saints, and Scoundrels: Folk Narrative in Hindu Religious Teaching* [Contemporary Ethnography Series; gen. eds. Dan Rose and Paul Stoller], Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press 1989. xi, 266 pp., Bibliography, Index, Plates. £35.95/£9.85.
- Nilo-Saharan Newsletter*, No. 3 (November 1988).
- OLIVER, Douglas L., *Native Cultures of the Pacific Islands*, Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press 1989. ix, 154 pp., Bibliography, Index, Figures. No price given.
- OLIVER, Douglas L., *Oceania: The Native Cultures of Australia and the Pacific Islands*, Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press 1989 (2 vols.). xii, 1183 pp., Figures, Maps. No price given.
- PLATTNER, Stuart (ed.), *Economic Anthropology*, Stanford: Stanford University Press 1989. xii, 425 pp., References Cited, Index, Tables, Figures. \$49.50/\$16.95.
- POST, Harry, *Pillarization: An Analysis of Dutch and Belgian Society*, Aldershot etc.: Avebury 1989. x, 277 pp., Bibliography, Tables. No price given.
- RICHARDS, Graham, *On Psychological Language and the Physiomorphic Basis of Human Nature* [International Library of Psychology], London and New York: Routledge 1989. xii, 156 pp., References, Indexes, Tables. £25.00.
- ROOSENS, Eugen E., *Creating Ethnicity: The Process of Ethnogenesis* [Frontiers of Anthropology vol. 5; ser. ed. H. Russell Bernard], Newbury Park CA etc.: Sage Publications 1989. 161 pp., References, Tables, Maps. £12.50.
- SHENNAN S.J., *Archaeological Approaches to Cultural Identity* [One World Archaeology 10; ser. ed. Peter J. Ucko], London etc.: Unwin Hyman 1989. xxv, 312 pp., Index, Figures, Maps. £35.00.
- SMITH, Valene L. (ed.), *Hosts and Guest: The Anthropology of Tourism* (2nd edn.), Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press 1989. xi, 279 pp. Reference List and Bibliography, Index, Plates. £34.95/£16.15.
- Social Sciences* [USSR Academy of Sciences], Vol. XX, no. 3 (1989): Vol. XX, no. 4 (1989).
- SOFFER, Olga, and Clive GAMBLE, *The World at 18000 BP, Volume One: High Latitudes* [One World Archaeology], London etc.: Unwin Hyman 1990. xix, 343 pp., Indexes, Maps, Tables, Figures. £45.00.
- STEINKRAUSS, Keith H. (ed.), *Industrialization of Indigenous Fermented Foods* [Food Science and Technology Series no. 33], New York and Basel: Marcel Dekker 1989. xii, 429 pp., Index, Figures, Tables, Illustrations. No price given.
- STOLLER, Paul, *Fusion of the Worlds: An Ethnography of Possession Among the Songhay of Niger*, Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press 1989. xxii, 215 pp., Notes, Glossary, References, Illustrations, Map. £19.95.
- TONKIN, Elizabeth, Maryon McDONALD, and Malcom CHAPMAN (eds.), *History and Ethnicity* [ASA Monographs 27], London and New York: Routledge 1989. ix, 261 pp., Indexes. £15.95.
- TORRENCE, Gaylord, and Robert HOBBS, *Art of the Red Earth People: The Mesquakie of Iowa*, [n.p.]: The University of Iowa Museum of Art 1989. x, 133 pp., Selected Bibliography, Plates, Illustrations. \$50.00/\$24.95.
- VAN DER LEEUW, S.E., and R. TORRENCE (eds.), *What's New? A Closer Look at the Process of Innovation* [One World Archaeology 14; ser. ed. Peter J. Ucko], London etc.: Unwin Hyman 1989. xx, 346 pp., Index, Figures, Illustrations. £40.00.